BOOK 1 OF PLATO'S REPUBLIC:
A WORD BY WORD GUIDE
TO TRANSLATION
(VOL 2: CHAPTERS 13–24)

BOOK 1 OF PLATO'S REPUBLIC: A WORD BY WORD GUIDE TO TRANSLATION (VOL 2: CHAPTERS 13–24)

DREW A. MANNETTER

Book 1 of Plato's Republic: A Word by Word Guide to Translation (Vol 2: Chapters 13–24)

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PART III: (339.b-342.e)   1

Socrates criticizes Thrasymachus' claim that "justice is the interest of the stronger" by showing that rulers sometimes make errors and enjoin harmful things for themselves. Thrasymachus defends his position with an ad hoc argument that real rules never make errors. Socrates attacks his definition by arguing that the practitioner of any art (medicine, pilot, etc.) aims for the good of the object of his art (patient, sailor, etc.) and not the good for himself and, therefore, the aim of the ruler is not his own good but that of the ruled.

III.1: (339.b-340.a)   3

Socrates argues that if justice is both the advantage of the stronger and the ruled doing what is ordered, every time a ruler makes a mistake and orders something contrary to his own good, it turns out that the ruled must do something that is disadvantageous to the ruler.

III.2: (340.a-340.c)   24

Cleitophon defends Thrasymachus' position by watering it down to the rulers doing what they assume to be in their interest. Polemarchus points out that this was not Thrasymachus' position.

III.3: (340.c-341.c)   38

Thrasymachus defends his position by denying that any craftsman errors while practicing his craft (for example, a doctor who misdiagnosis a patient is not a doctor but a quack). Therefore, the real ruler will never err and consequently will never mistake his own interest.

III.4: (341.c-342.e)   74

Socrates does not specifically argue against Thrasymachus' assertion that a craftsman never errs but instead defines what the nature of an art is. He shows that by its very nature an art is not concerned with the good of itself since the art is perfect in its nature, but with the good of its object. A doctor uses the medical art to heal the sick and horsemanship looks out for the interest of horses; likewise, by analogy with other arts, the ruler uses the ruling art for the good of his subjects and not for the good of his art or himself.

PART VI: (350.d-352.d)   357

Socrates addresses the next question: is injustice more powerful than justice? Thrasymachus refuses to argue further and simply answers Socrates' questions. Socrates turns to the analogy of a city to examine whether it would be more powerful with justice or injustice. He argues that injustice leads to factions in a city and factions to weakness. The same is true on the individual level.

PART VII: (352.d-354.a)   423

Socrates addresses the final question: whether the just or the unjust man lead happier lives. Socrates constructs an argument from analogy that everything has a proper function and virtue (for example, the function of the eyes is to see and the virtue is sight). The soul also has a proper function (rule) and a virtue (justice) as opposed to a bad soul will have a defective function (mismanagement) and vice (injustice). The just man is thus happy and the unjust man miserable.

CONCLUSION: (354.a-354.c)   473

Despite all the discussion, the core question remains of what justice is. Without that fundamental question answered, Socrates cannot hope to know anything about it and the discussion ends with the familiar Socratic claim to complete ignorance.

NOTES ON THE TEXT

The reader should be familiar with the following conventions and terms. Capital letters in the Greek text indicate a change of interlocutor.

Punctuation (S. 188):

Greek , (comma) = English , (comma).
Greek . (period) = English . (period).
Greek · (point above the line) = English : and ; (colon and semicolon).
Greek ; (semicolon) = English ? (question mark).

Accents (S. 138-87):

Acute: ´
Circumflex: ˆ
Grave: `

Syllables:

The last syllable is called the *ultima*: σοφός.
The next to the last syllable is called the *penult*: νόμος.
The one before the penult is called the *antepenult*: ἄνθροπος.

Words are named according to their accent as follows:

Oxytone (acute on the ultima): θήρ, καλός, λελυκώς.
Paroxytone (acute on the penult): λύω, λείπω, λελυκότος.
Proparoxytone (acute on the antepenult): ἄνθροπος, παδεύομεν.
Perispomenon (circumflex on the ultima): γῆ, θεοῦ.
Properispomenon (circumflex on the penult): πρᾶξις, μοῦσα.

Abbreviations in the citations:

S.:

Smyth, Herbert Weir, *Greek Grammar*. Revised by Gordon M. Messing. Harvard University Press. 1984.

D.:

Denniston, J.D., *The Greek Particle*. Second Edition revised by K.J. Dover. Hackett Publishing Company, Inc.. Indianapolis/Cambridge.1991.

L. and S.:

Liddell and Scott, *An Intermediate Greek Dictionary*. Oxford at the Clarendon Press, Oxford University Press, 1986.

Liddell and Scott, *A Greek-English Lexicon*. Oxford at the Clarendon Press, Oxford University Press, 1968.

Other sources:

The Greek text was taken from *The Republic of Plato. Edited with Critical Notes, Commentary and Appendices*. James Adam, M.A.. Vol. 1. Cambridge at the University Press, 1902. This can be accessed at the web site: Tarik Wareh public-domain classics books – Union College (WWW1.union.edu/wareh/books).

PART III

PART III: (339.b-342.e)

Socrates criticizes Thrasymachus' claim that "justice is the interest of the stronger" by showing that rulers sometimes make errors and enjoin harmful things for themselves. Thrasymachus defends his position with an ad hoc argument that real rules never make errors. Socrates attacks his definition by arguing that the practitioner of any art (medicine, pilot, etc.) aims for the good of the object of his art (patient, sailor, etc.) and not the good for himself and, therefore, the aim of the ruler is not his own good but that of the ruled.

III.1: (339.b-340.a)

Socrates argues that if justice is both the advantage of the stronger and the ruled doing what is ordered, every time a ruler makes a mistake and orders something contrary to his own good, it turns out that the ruled must do something that is disadvantageous to the ruler.

XIII. Ταῦτ᾿ ἔσται, ἦν δ᾿ ἐγώ. καί μοι εἰπέ· οὐ καὶ πείθεσθαι μέντοι τοῖς ἄρχουσι δίκαιον φὴς εἶναι; Ἔγωγε. (339.b-c)

ἄρχων, -οντος, ὁ: *he* or *the one who rules, a ruler.*
δέ: *and.*
δίκαιον, -ου, τό: *justice, the right* or *lawful.*
ἐγώ, ἐμοῦ: *I, of me.*
ἔγωγε, ἐμοῦγε: *I at least, for my part, for myself.*
εἰμί: *to be.*
εἶπον: *to speak, say.*

ἠμί: *to say.*
καί: *and now, just; also, too.*
οὐ … μέντοι: *do you not surely?*
οὗτος, αὕτη, τοῦτο: *this man, woman,* or *thing.*
πείθομαι: *to listen to, obey.*
φημί: *to say, affirm, assert.*

Ταῦτ᾿: Plural, neuter, nominative pronoun used substantively; the antecedent is the proposed examination of Thrasymachus' idea (S. 1238, 1245). Nominative subject of ἔσται (S. 927, 938). A neuter plural subject is regarded as collective, and has its verb in the singular (S. 958). Elision of Ταῦτα (S. 70).

ἔσται: Third person, singular, future, indicative of εἰμί (S. 768). Main verb of the simple sentence (S. 903).

ἦν δ᾿ ἐγώ: This phrase introduces the *oratio recta* (S. 2590). ἦν: First person, singular, imperfect, indicative of ἠμί (S. 792). Main verb of the introductory phrase (S. 903). The irregular verb only occurs in the present and imperfect 1st and 3d singular (= Latin **inquam, inquit**) (S. 792). δ᾿: Postpositive conjunction connecting this sentence with the previous one; the copulative δέ marks transition, and is the ordinary particle used in connecting successive clauses or sentences which add something new or different, but not opposed, to what precedes, and are not joined by other particles, such as γάρ or οὖν (S. 2835-2836). "As a connective, δέ denotes either pure connection 'and', or contrast, 'but', with all that lies between" (D. 162). An elision of δὲ (S. 70). ἐγώ: Singular, nominative of the personal pronoun ἐγώ (S. 325). Nominative

subject of ἦν (S. 927, 938). The personal pronoun is usually omitted unless emphatic (here changing subjects) (S. 1190). An acute, when not immediately followed by another word, does not change to a grave (S. 154).

καί: The conjunction connects this sentence with the previous one; with the imperative, the conjunction can mean "and now, just" (S. 2868, 2873). The acute accent on the oxytone is not changed to a grave when followed by an enclitic (S. 154.a).

μοι: Singular, dative, enclitic form of the personal pronoun ἐγώ (S. 325). Dative indirect object of εἰπέ (S. 1471). The enclitic pronoun loses its accent after the oxytone καί (S. 181).

εἰπέ: Second person, singular, aorist, active imperative of εἶπον (S. 385). Main verb of the simple sentence (S. 903). The subject σύ is not expressed but implied in the verb; the nominative of the personal pronoun is usually omitted except when emphatic (S. 929, 1190). The aorist tense of the imperative denotes simple occurrence (S. 1864.b). The accent on this form of the verb is oxytone (S. 424.b). An acute, when not immediately followed by another word, does not change to a grave (S. 154).

οὐ … μέντοι: The combination of particles expects a positive answer (S. 2918.a). **οὐ**: The simple negative particle οὐ is the negative of fact and statement (S. 2688). When οὐ introduces a direct question, the answer "yes" is expected (S. 2651). **μέντοι**: The postpositive particle marks the question as expecting a positive answer (as **nonne** in Latin) (S. 2917-18) (D. μέντοι, pg. 403).

καὶ: Adverbial use of the particle meaning "also" (S. 2881).

πείθεσθαι … δίκαιον … εἶναι: Accusative/infinitive in indirect discourse after φῇς (S. 2592).

πείθεσθαι: Present, middle infinitive of πείθω (S. 383). Accusative subject of εἶναι; in definitions, the infinitive may be used as an accusative subject (S. 973, 1986). The present tense of the infinitive denotes continual action (S. 1865).

τοῖς ἄρχουσι: Plural, masculine, dative, present, active attributive participle of ἄρχω used substantively with the article (S. 1153.b, 2050). Dative direct object of the infinitive πείθεσθαι (S. 1464, 1967.b). Participles used substantively admit distinctions of voice and tense; the present tense denotes continual action (S. 1153.b, 1872.a).

δίκαιον: Singular, neuter, accusative of the adjective δίκαιος used substantively (S. 1021, 1023). Predicate accusative noun modifying πείθεσθαι after εἶναι (S. 910). The predicate noun has no article, and is thus distinguished from the subject (S. 1150).

φῇς: Second person, singular, present, indicative of φημί (S. 783). Main verb of the complex sentence (S. 2173). The subject σύ is not expressed but implied in the verb; the nominative of the personal pronoun is usually omitted except when emphatic (S. 929, 1190).

εἶναι: Present infinitive of εἰμί (S. 768). The infinitive in indirect discourse (S. 2016). Main verb of the indirect discourse. The infinitive represents a finite verb after verbs of saying and thinking; each tense of direct discourse is retained (with its proper meaning as regards stage of action) when it becomes infinitive in indirect discourse (S. 2019, 2022).

Ἔγωγε: Singular, nominative form of the personal pronoun ἔγωγε (S. 325.b). The suffix -γε attached to the pronoun ἐγώ makes it emphatic (S. 325.b). The compound of ἐγώ γε becomes a proparoxytone (S. 186.a). The word signifies a "yes" answer (S. 2680.b).

Πότερον δὲ ἀναμάρτητοί εἰσιν οἱ ἄρχοντες ἐν ταῖς πόλεσιν ἑκάσταις ἢ οἷοί τι καὶ ἁμαρτεῖν; (339.c)

ἁμαρτάνω: *to fail of doing, fail, go wrong.*

ἀναμάρτητος, -ον: *without missing, unfailing, unerring.*

ἄρχων, -οντος, ὁ: *he* or *the one who rules, a ruler.*

δέ: *but.*

εἰμί: *to be.*

ἕκαστος, -η, -ον: *every, every one, each, each one.*

ἐν (+ dat.): *in.*

καί: *even.*

οἷος, οἵα, οἷον: *be able, possible,* or *capable.*

πόλις, -εως, ἡ: *city.*

πότερον … ἤ: *whether … or.*

τι: *somewhat, in any degree, at all.*

(λέγοις ἂν) Πότερον … ἤ: The adverb and conjunction introduce direct alternative questions (S. 2656). Supply λέγοις ἂν ("tell me") as the main verb of the sentence; in lively discourse the form of the verb signifying to speak may be omitted for brevity. The ellipsis is often unconscious and it is frequently uncertain what is to be supplied to complete the thought (S. 946, 1830).

Πότερον … ἑκάσταις: First alternative direct question (S. 2656).

δὲ: Postpositive conjunction connecting this sentence with the previous one; here the particle δέ has an adversative sense and serves to mark that something is different from what precedes, but only to offset it, not to exclude or contradict it (S. 2834-35). "As a connective, δέ denotes either pure connection 'and', or contrast, 'but', with all that lies between" (D. δέ, pg. 162).

ἀναμάρτητοί: Plural, nominative, masculine predicate adjective modifying οἱ ἄρχοντες after εἰσιν (S. 1040). The acute accent on the ultima syllable is thrown back from the following enclitic εἰσιν (S. 183.c).

εἰσιν: Third person, singular, present, indicative of εἰμί (S. 768). Main verb of the simple question (S. 903). The enclitic verb throws back its accent onto the previous proparoxytone ἀναμάρτητοί (S. 183.c). The moveable -ν is added to words ending in -σι when the next word begins with a vowel (S. 134).

οἱ ἄρχοντες: Plural, masculine, nominative, present, active attributive participle of ἄρχω used substantively with the article (S. 1153.b, 2050). Nominative subject of εἰσιν (S. 927, 938). Participles used substantively admit distinctions of voice and tense; the present tense denotes continual action (S. 1153.b, 1872.a).

ἐν ταῖς πόλεσιν ἑκάσταις: Prepositional phrase; ἐν with the dative (locative) here means "in" (S. 1687.1.a). ταῖς: The article is very often omitted in phrases containing a preposition but

not here (S. 1128). **ἑκάσταις**: Plural, feminine, dative indefinite pronominal adjective modifying **πόλεσιν** (S. 337). **ἕκαστος** occupies the predicate position after the article and noun (S. 1179).

ἢ … ἁμαρτεῖν: Second alternative direct question (S. 2656).

οἷοί {(ἐισί) = (οἷοι ἐισί)}: Plural, nominative, masculine relative pronoun (S. 340). Predicate nominative after the supplied verb **ἐισί** (S. 1040). The acute accent on the ultima syllable is thrown back from the following enclitic **τι** (S. 183.c). **ἐισί**: Supply **ἐισί** ("are they") as the main verb of the simple question; the copulative verb **εἶναι** is often omitted (S. 944). The quasi-impersonal construction governs the infinitive (S. 1985).

τι: The singular, neuter, accusative of the indefinite pronoun is used adverbially (S. 341, 1094). The enclitic throws back its accent onto the previous properispomenon **οἷοί** (S. 183.c).

καὶ: Adverbial use of the particle meaning "even" (S. 2881).

ἁμαρτεῖν: Aorist, active infinitive of **ἁμαρτάνω** (S. 384). An object (complementary) infinitive after **οἷοί** (S. 2000). The aorist tense of the infinitive denotes simple occurrence (S. 1865.b).

> **Πάντως που, ἔφη οἷοί τι καὶ ἁμαρτεῖν. (339.c)**
>
> ---
>
> **ἁμαρτάνω**: *to fail of doing, fail, go wrong.* **πού**: *anyway, possibly, perhaps, I suppose.*
> **καί**: *even.* **τι**: *somewhat, in any degree, at all.*
> **οἷος, οἵα, οἷον**: *be able, possible,* or *capable.* **φημί**: *to say, affirm, assert.*
> **πάντως**: *yes, by all means.*

Πάντως: Confirmatory adverb (S. 2680).

που: Enclitic particle used to qualify the expression (L. S. **που** II). The monosyllabic enclitic loses its accent after the paroxytone **Πάντως** (S. 181).

ἔφη: Third person, singular, imperfect, indicative of **φημί** (S. 783). The verb introduces the *oratio recta* (S. 2590). The subject **ἐκεῖνος** (the antecedent is **ὁ Θρασύμαχος**) is not expressed but implied in the verb (S. 931).

οἷοί … ἁμαρτεῖν: Words are often repeated in "yes" answers with the confirmatory adverb **Πάντως** (S. 2680).

οἷοί {(ἐισί) = (οἷοι ἐισί)}: Plural, nominative, masculine relative pronoun (S. 340). Predicate nominative after the supplied verb **ἐισί** (S. 1040). The acute accent on the ultima syllable is thrown back from the following enclitic **τι** (S. 183.c). **ἐισί**: Supply **ἐισί** ("they are") as the main verb of the simple sentence; the copulative verb **εἶναι** is often omitted (S. 944). The quasi-impersonal construction governs the infinitive (S. 1985).

τι: The singular, neuter, accusative of the indefinite pronoun is used adverbially (S. 341, 1094). The enclitic throws back its accent onto the previous properispomenon **οἷοί** (S. 183.c).

καὶ: The particle is here used adverbially meaning "even" (S. 2881).

ἁμαρτεῖν: Aorist, active infinitive of **ἁμαρτάνω** (S. 384). An object (complementary) infinitive after **οἷοί** (S. 1989). The aorist tense of the infinitive denotes simple occurrence (S. 1865.b).

Οὐκοῦν ἐπιχειροῦντες νόμους τιθέναι τοὺς μὲν ὀρθῶς τιθέασι, τοὺς δέ τινας οὐκ ὀρθῶς; Οἶμαι ἔγωγε. **(339.c)**

ἔγωγε, ἐμοῦγε: *I at least, for my part, for myself.*

ἐπιχειρέω: *to attempt, endeavor.*

νόμος, -ου, ὁ: *custom, law, ordinance.*

ὁ μὲν … ὁ δέ: *on the one hand one … on the other hand another.*

οἶμαι: *to think, suppose, believe.*

ὀρθῶς: *rightly, truly, correctly.*

οὐ: *not.*

οὐκοῦν: *therefore, then, accordingly, so then.*

τίθημι: *to lay down, give, make.*

τις, τι: *some.*

Οὐκοῦν … τιθέασι: First coordinate clause (S. 2162).

Οὐκοῦν: Interrogative adverb introducing a direct question; here the stress lies on the inferential **οὖν** and an affirmative answer is expected as a matter of course. **οὐκοῦν** stands at the beginning of the clause (S. 2951).

ἐπιχειροῦντες: Plural, masculine, nominative, present, active, circumstantial participle of **ἐπιχειρέω** modifying **ἐκεῖνοι**, the implied subject of **τιθέασι** (S. 2042, 2054). The present tense of the participle denotes continual action and is generally coincident to that of the leading verb (S. 1872.a).

νόμους: Accusative direct object of the infinitive **τιθέναι** (S. 1554, 1967.b). The noun lacks an article (S. 1126).

τιθέναι: Present, active infinitive of **τίθημι** (S. 416). An object (complimentary) infinitive after **ἐπιχειροῦντες** (S. 1989). The present tense of the infinitive denotes continual action (S. 1865).

τοὺς: Plural, masculine, accusative article used as a demonstrative pronoun meaning "some" (S. 1106). Accusative direct object of **τιθέασι** (S. 1554). The pronoun is in partitive apposition to **νόμους** (S. 981).

μὲν … δέ: The two particles **μὲν … δέ** draw a contrast between the two coordinate clauses (S. 2904).

δέ: The oxytone, followed by an enclitic, retains its accent and does not change from the acute to grave (S. 183.a).

ὀρθῶς: Adverb of manner (S. 343, 1094).

τιθέασι: Third person, plural, present, active, indicative of **τίθημι** (S. 416). Main verb of the simple coordinate clause (S. 2162). The subject **ἐκεῖνοι** (the antecedent is **οἱ ἄρχοντες**) is not expressed but implied in the verb (S. 931).

τοὺς … ὀρθῶς: Second coordinate clause (S. 2162).

τοὺς … τινας (τιθέασι): Accusative direct object of the supplied verb **τιθέασι** (S. 1554). **τοὺς**: Plural, masculine, accusative article used as a demonstrative pronoun meaning "others" (S. 1106). The pronoun is in partitive apposition to **νόμους** (S. 981). **τινας**: Plural, masculine, accusative indefinite pronoun used as an adjective modifying **τοὺς** (S. 1266). The enclitic pronoun loses its accent after the oxytone **δέ** (S. 183.a). **τιθέασι**: Carry down **τιθέασι** as the main verb of the second coordinate clause; when the main verb in both coordinate clauses is the same it is not normally repeated (S. 948).

οὐκ: The simple negative particle **οὐ** is the negative of fact and statement (S. 2688). The -**κ** is added to **οὐ** before a smooth breathing (S. 137).

ὀρθῶς: Adverb of manner (S. 343, 1094).

Οἶμαι: First person, singular, present, deponent, indicative of **οἶμαι** (S. 383). Main verb of the simple sentence (S. 903). An Attic contraction of **οἴομαι** (L.S. **οἴομαι**).

ἔγωγε: Singular, nominative form of the personal pronoun **ἔγωγε** (S. 325.b). Nominative subject of **Οἶμαι** (S. 927, 938). The suffix -**γε** attached to the pronoun **ἐγώ** makes it emphatic (S. 325.b). The compound of **ἐγώ γε** becomes a proparoxytone (S. 186.a).

Τὸ δὲ ὀρθῶς ἆρα τὸ τὰ ξυμφέροντά ἐστι τίθεσθαι ἑαυτοῖς, τὸ δὲ μὴ ὀρθῶς ἀξύμφορα; ἢ πῶς λέγεις; Οὕτως. (339.c)

ἀξύμφορον, -ου, τό: *an inexpedient or disadvantageous thing.*

ἆρα: *then? therefore?*

δέ: *and; but.*

ἑαυτοῦ, -ῆς, -οῦ: *of himself, herself, itself.*

εἰμί: *to be.*

ἤ: *or.*

λέγω: *to say, mean.*

μή: *not.*

ξυμφέροντα, -όντων, τά: *profit, advantage, interest.*

ὀρθῶς, τό, τοῦ: *the right way, the correct way.*

οὕτως: *in this way* or *manner, so, thus.*

πῶς: *how?*

τίθεμαι: *to make (for oneself).*

τό, τοῦ: *the.*

Τὸ … ἑαυτοῖς: First coordinate clause (S. 2162).

Τὸ … ὀρθῶς: Nominative subject of **ἐστι** (S. 927, 938). **Τὸ**: Singular, neuter, nominative article introducing the adverb (S. 1153.g). **ὀρθῶς**: Adverb; the adverb is made into a substantive by the addition of an article (S. 1153.g).

δὲ: Postpositive conjunction connecting this sentence with the previous one; the copulative **δέ** marks transition, and is the ordinary particle used in connecting successive clauses or sentences which add something new or different, but not opposed, to what precedes, and are not joined by other particles, such as **γάρ** or **οὖν** (S. 2835-2836). "As a connective, **δέ** denotes either pure connection 'and', or contrast, 'but', with all that lies between" (D. **δέ**, pg. 162).

ἆρα: The interrogative particle introduces the direct question (S. 2650).

τὸ τὰ ξυμφέροντά … τίθεσθαι ἑαυτοῖς: Predicate nominative modifying **Τὸ … ὀρθῶς** after **ἐστι** (S. 910).

τὸ … τίθεσθαι: Articular infinitive (S. 2025). **τὸ**: Singular, neuter, nominative article used to introduce the infinitive (S. 2026). **τίθεσθαι**: Present, middle infinitive of **τίθημι** (S. 416). The present tense of the infinitive denotes continual action (S. 1865).

τὰ ξυμφέροντά: Plural, neuter, accusative, present, active attributive participle of **ξυμφέρω** used substantively with the article (S. 1153.b, 2050). Accusative direct object of the infinitive **τίθεσθαι** (S. 1554, 1967). The acute accent on the ultimate syllable of the properispomenon is thrown back from the following enclitic **ἐστι** (S. 183.c). A word or group of words standing between the article and its noun is an attributive (S. 1154). The participle used substantively may be used in the singular or plural to mean "profit, advantage" (L.S. **συμφέρω**, II 2).

ἐστι: Third person, singular, present, active of **εἰμί** (S. 768). Main verb of the simple coordinate clause (S. 2162). The enclitic throws back its accent onto the previous properispomenon **ξυμφέροντά** (S. 183.c).

ἑαυτοῖς: Plural, masculine, dative reflexive pronoun; the antecedent is the unexpressed accusative subject of **τίθεσθαι** (the antecedent for the accusative subject would be **οἱ ἄρχοντες**) (S. 329, 1226). Dative indirect object of the infinitive **τίθεσθαι** (S. 1469, 1967.b).

τὸ … ἀξύμφορα: Second coordinate clause; when the main verb in both coordinate clauses is the same it is not normally repeated (S. 948, 2162).

τὸ … μὴ ὀρθῶς: Nominative subject of the supplied verb **ἐστι** (S. 927, 938). **τὸ**: Singular, neuter, nominative article introducing the adverb (S. 1153.g). **μὴ**: Negative adverb; with adverbs used substantively, the negative **οὐ** is used when a person or thing is meant, but **μή** when a person or thing is to be characterized (S. 2734-35). **ὀρθῶς**: Adverb; the adverb is made into a substantive by the addition of an article (S. 1153.g).

δὲ: Postpositive conjunction connecting the two coordinate clauses; here the particle **δέ** has an adversative sense and serves to mark that something is different from what precedes, but only to offset it, not to exclude or contradict it (S. 2834-35). "As a connective, **δέ** denotes either pure connection 'and', or contrast, 'but', with all that lies between" (D. **δέ**, pg. 162).

(τὸ τὰ) ἀξύμφορα (ἐστι τίθεσθαι ἑαυτοῖς) = (τὸ τὰ ἀξύμφορά ἐστι τίθεσθαι ἑαυτοῖς): Accusative direct object of the supplied infinitive **τίθεσθαι** (S. 1554, 1967). The noun lacks an article (S. 1126). Carry down **τὸ τὰ … ἐστι τίθεσθαι ἑαυτοῖς** from the previous clause to fill in the brachylogy (S. 3017).

ἤ: Disjunctive conjunction connecting this sentence with the previous one (S. 2856).

πῶς: Interrogative adverb of manner introducing a direct question (S. 346, 1094).

λέγεις: Second person, singular, present, active, indicative of **λέγω** (S. 383). Main verb of the simple direct question (S. 903). The subject **σύ** is not expressed but implied in the verb; the nominative of the personal pronoun is usually omitted except when emphatic (S. 929, 1190).

Οὕτως: The lone adverb implying a "yes" answer is an ellipsis of **ἔστιν οὕτως** (S. 2680.c).

Ἃ δ᾿ ἂν θῶνται, ποιητέον τοῖς ἀρχομένοις, καὶ τοῦτό ἐστι τὸ δίκαιον; Πῶς γὰρ οὔ; (339.c-d)

ἄν: *would.*
ἀρχόμενος, ἀρχομένου, ὁ: *he* or *the one who is ruled, the ruled.*
γάρ: *for.*
δέ: *but.*
δίκαιον, -ου, τό: *justice, the right* or *lawful.*
εἰμί: *to be.*
καί: *and.*

ὅς, ἥ, ὅ: *whoever, whichever, whatever.*
οὐ: *not.*
οὗτος, αὕτη, τοῦτο: *this man, woman,* or *thing.*
ποιητέος, -α, -ον: *to be made* or *done.*
πῶς: *how?*
τίθεμαι: *to lay down, give, make.*

Ἃ … ἀρχομένοις: First coordinate clause (S. 2162).

Ἃ δ᾿ ἂν θῶνται: Relative clause in apposition to **τοῦτο**, the supplied subject of the supplied verb **ἔστι** (S. 988, 2488-2573). When the antecedent is indefinite, the compound relatives (**ὅστις**, etc.) are used, but the simple relatives are often employed (as here) instead. When the antecedent is indefinite, **ὅς** usually has the subjunctive with **ἄν** (as here) or the optative (S. 2508, 2545.c).

Ἃ: Plural, neuter, accusative relative pronoun used substantively meaning "whatever things"; the antecedent is indefinite (S. 338, 2509). Accusative direct object of **θῶνται** (S. 1554).

δ᾿: Postpositive conjunction connecting this sentence with the previous one; here the particle **δέ** has an adversative sense and serves to mark that something is different from what precedes,

but only to offset it, not to exclude or contradict it (S. 2834-35). "As a connective, **δέ** denotes either pure connection 'and', or contrast, 'but', with all that lies between" (D. **δέ**, pg. 162). An elision of **δὲ** (S. 70).

ἂν θῶνται: Main verb of the relative clause (S. 2173). **ἂν**: Relative clauses requiring the subjunctive must have **ἂν**, which is more closely attached to the relative word than it is to the subjunctive (S. 1768). **θῶνται**: Third person, plural, aorist, middle, subjunctive of **τίθημι** (S. 416). The subject **ἐκεῖνοι** (the antecedent is **οἱ ἄρχοντες**) is not expressed but implied in the verb (S. 931). The subjunctive with **ἂν** in a relative clause expresses a possible or supposed fact in future time or a generality in present time (S. 2545.c). The aorist tense of the subjunctive denotes simple occurrence (S. 1860).

ποιητέον {(**τοῦτο ἐστί**) = (**τοῦτ᾽ ἔστι**)}: Impersonal, active verb (S. 2152). Singular, neuter, nominative verbal adjective used impersonally to express necessity (S. 2152). Predicate nominative modifying **τοῦτ᾽**, the supplied pronoun after the supplied verb **ἔστι** (S. 1040). Main verb of the complex coordinate clause (S. 2162). **τοῦτ᾽ ἔστι**: Supply **τοῦτ᾽** ("this") as the subject of **ἔστι**; supply **ἔστι** as the main verb of the complex coordinate clause (the copulative verb **εἶναι** is often omitted) (S. 944).

τοῖς ἀρχομένοις: Plural, masculine, dative, present, passive attributive participle of **ἄρχω** used substantively with the article (S. 1153.b, 2050). Dative of agent with **ποιητέον** (S. 2149). Participles used substantively admit distinctions of voice and tense; the present tense denotes continual action (S. 1153.b, 1872.a).

καὶ: The conjunction connects the two coordinate clauses (S. 2868).

τοῦτό … δίκαιον: Second coordinate clause (S. 2162).

τοῦτό ἐστι: The combination is commonly written **τοῦτ᾽ ἔστι** (S. 187.b).

τοῦτό: Singular, neuter, nominative demonstrative pronoun used substantively; the antecedent is the idea contained in the previous clause (S. 1212, 1238, 1247). Nominative subject of **ἐστι** (S. 927, 938). The acute accent on the ultima syllable is thrown back from the following enclitic **ἐστι** (S. 183.c).

ἐστι: Third person, singular, present, active of **εἰμί** (S. 768). Main verb of the simple coordinate clause (S. 2162). The enclitic throws its accent back onto the properispomenon **τοῦτό** (S. 183.c).

τὸ δίκαιον: Singular, neuter, nominative of the adjective **δίκαιος** used substantively with the article (S. 1021, 1153.a). Predicate nominative noun after **ἐστι** (S. 910). A predicate noun may have an article when the noun refers to a definite object (an individual or class) that is well known, previously mentioned or hinted at, or identical with the subject (S. 1152).

Πῶς γὰρ οὔ: The phrase answers "yes" in the form of a question (S. 2680.d). **Πῶς**: Interrogative adverb of manner (S. 346, 1094). **γὰρ**: The post-positive particle marks assent in answers (S. 2806). **οὔ**: The simple negative particle **οὐ** is the negative of fact and statement (S. 2688). The proclitic takes an acute accent at the end of a sentence (S. 180.a). An acute, when not immediately followed by another word, does not change to a grave (S. 154).

Οὐ μόνον ἄρα δίκαιόν ἐστι κατὰ τὸν σὸν λόγον τὸ τοῦ κρείττονος ξυμφέρον ποιεῖν, ἀλλὰ καὶ τοὐναντίον τὸ μὴ ξυμφέρον. (339.d)

ἄρα: *then, therefore.*
δίκαιον, **-ου**, **τό**: *justice, the right* or *lawful.*
εἰμί: *to be.*
ἐναντίον **-ου**, **τό**: *the opposite, contrary,* or *reverse.*
κατά (+ acc.): *according to.*
κρεῖττον, **-ονος**, **τό**: *the stronger* or *more powerful party.*

λόγος, **-ου**, **ὁ**: *argument.*
μή: *not.*
ξυμφέρον, **-οντος**, **τό**: *use, profit, advantage, interest.*
οὐ μόνον … ἀλλὰ καί: *not only … but also.*
ποιέω: *to make, do.*
σός, **-ή**, **-όν**: *your, of you.*

Οὐ … ποιεῖν: First coordinate clause (S. 2162).

Οὐ μόνον … ἀλλὰ καί: The collection of particles connects the two coordinate clauses and means "not only … but also" (S. 2764).

Οὐ: The simple negative particle **οὐ** is the negative of fact and statement (S. 2688, 2690).

μόνον: Singular, neuter, accusative of the adjective **μόνος** used as an adverb (S. 341, 1094, 1606).

ἄρα: The postpositive particle is often used of direct logical conclusions in conducting an argument (S. 2791).

δίκαιόν: Singular, neuter, nominative of the adjective **δίκαιος** used substantively without the article (S. 1021, 1023, 1126). Nominative subject of **ἐστὶ** (S. 927, 938). The acute accent on the ultima syllable is thrown back from the following enclitic **ἐστι** (S. 183.c).

ἐστι: Third person, singular, present, active of **εἰμί** (S. 768). Main verb of the simple coordinate clause (S. 2162). The enclitic throws back its accent onto the previous proparoxytone **δίκαιόν** (S. 183.c).

κατὰ τὸν σὸν λόγον: Prepositional phrase; **κατά** with the accusative here means "according to" (S. 1690.2.c). **τὸν**: The article is very often omitted in phrases containing a preposition but not here (S. 1128). **σὸν**: Singular, masculine, accusative possessive pronoun used as an adjective modifying **λόγον** (S. 330). A word or group of words standing between the article and its noun is an attributive (S. 1154).

τὸ τοῦ κρείττονος ξυμφέρον: Accusative direct object of the infinitive **ποιεῖν** (S. 1554, 1967). **τοῦ κρείττονος**: Singular, neuter, genitive of the comparative adjective **κρείττων** used substantively with the article (S. 319, 1153.a). Genitive of possession or belonging (S. 1297). A word or group of words standing between the article and its noun is an attributive (S. 1154). Attic has -**ττ**- for -**σσ**- of Ionic and most other dialects (S. 78).

ποιεῖν: Present, active infinitive of **ποιέω** (S. 385). Predicate nominative modifying **δίκαιόν** after **ἐστι**; in definitions, the infinitive may be used as a predicate nominative (S. 1986). The present tense of the infinitive denotes continual action (S. 1865).

ἀλλὰ: Adversative conjunction connecting the first and second coordinate clauses (S. 2775).

καὶ … ξυμφέρον: Second coordinate clause; when the main verb in both coordinate clauses is the same it is not normally repeated (S. 948, 2162).

καὶ: Adverbial use of the particle meaning "also" (S. 2881).

τοὐναντίον (**δίκαιόν ἐστι ποιεῖν**): Singular, neuter, accusative of the adjective **ἐναντίος** used substantively with the article (S. 1153.a). Accusative direct object of the supplied infinitive **ποιεῖν** (S. 1554, 1967). Elision of **τὸ ἐναντίον** (S. 70). **δίκαιόν ἐστι ποιεῖν**: Carry down **δίκαιόν ἐστι ποιεῖν** from the previous clause to fill in the brachylogy (S. 3017).

τὸ (**τοῦ κρείττονος**) **μὴ ξυμφέρον**: Noun phrase in apposition to **τοὐναντίον** (988). **μὴ**: Negative adverb; the negative **μή** is used under the influence of the supplied infinitive **ποιεῖν** (S. 2713). **τοῦ κρείττονος**: Carry down **τοῦ κρείττονος** from the previous clause to fill in the brachylogy (S. 3017).

Τί λέγεις σύ; ἔφη. Ἃ σὺ λέγεις, ἔμοιγε δοκῶ· σκοπῶμεν δὲ βέλτιον. (**339.d**)

βέλτιον: *better, closer.*

δέ: *but.*

δοκέω: *to think, suppose.*

ἔγωγε, ἐμοῦγε: *I at least, for my part, for myself.*

λέγω: *to say, mean.*

ὅς, ἥ, ὅ: *who, which, what.*

σκοπέω: *to look at, consider, examine.*

σύ, σοῦ: *you, of you.*

τίς, τί: *who? what? which?*

φημί: *to say, affirm, assert.*

Τί: Singular, neuter, accusative interrogative pronoun used substantively meaning "what?" (S. 1262). Accusative direct object of **λέγεις** (S. 1554). The interrogative pronoun never changes its accent to the grave (S. 334).

λέγεις: Second person, singular, present, active, indicative of **λέγω** (S. 383). Main verb of the simple interrogative sentence (S. 903).

σύ: Singular, nominative personal pronoun of **σύ** (S. 325). Nominative subject of **λέγεις** (S. 927, 938). The personal pronoun is usually omitted unless emphatic (S. 1190). An acute, when not immediately followed by another word, does not change to a grave (S. 154).

ἔφη: Third person, singular, imperfect, indicative of **φημί** (S. 783). The verb introduces the *oratio recta* (S. 2590). The subject **ἐκεῖνος** (the antecedent is **ὁ Θρασύμαχος**) is not expressed but implied in the verb (S. 931).

Ἃ σὺ λέγεις: Relative clause (S. 2488-2573).

Ἃ: Plural, neuter, accusative relative pronoun used substantively; the antecedent is the supplied pronoun τὰ αὐτά (S. 338, 2509). Accusative direct object of λέγεις (S. 1554).

σὺ: Singular, nominative personal pronoun of σύ (S. 325). Nominative subject of λέγεις (S. 927, 938). The personal pronoun is usually omitted unless emphatic (S. 1190).

λέγεις: Second person, singular, present, active, indicative of λέγω (S. 383). Main verb of the relative clause (S. 2173).

ἔμοιγε δοκῶ: The personal construction with the dative is regular rather that the impersonal form δοκεῖ μοι (S. 1983, 1992.c).

ἔμοιγε: Singular, dative form of the personal pronoun ἔγωγε (S. 325.b). Dative direct complement of δοκῶ (S. 1467.a). The suffix -γε attached to the pronoun ἐγώ makes it emphatic (S. 325.b). The compound of ἐμοί γε becomes a proparoxytone (S. 186.a).

δοκῶ (λέγειν τὰ αὐτά): First person, singular, present, active, indicative of δοκέω (S. 385). Main verb of the complex sentence (S. 2173). The subject ἐγώ is not expressed but implied in the verb; the nominative of the personal pronoun is usually omitted except when emphatic (S. 929, 1190). λέγειν τὰ αὐτά: Supply λέγειν as a complementary infinitive with δοκῶ; supply τὰ αὐτά ("the same things") as the object of λέγειν and the antecedent of Ἃ (S. 3017).

σκοπῶμεν: First person, plural, present, active subjunctive of σκοπέω (S. 385). Main verb of the simple sentence (S. 903). The subject ἡμεῖς (here "us" and not "we") is not expressed but implied in the verb; the nominative of the personal pronoun is usually omitted except when emphatic (S. 929, 1190). Hortatory subjunctive; the hortatory subjunctive is used to express a request or a proposal (S. 1797). The present tense of the subjunctive denotes continual action (S. 1860).

δὲ: Postpositive conjunction connecting this sentence with the previous one; here the particle δέ has an adversative sense and serves to mark that something is different from what precedes, but only to offset it, not to exclude or contradict it (S. 2834-35). "As a connective, δέ denotes either pure connection 'and', or contrast, 'but', with all that lies between" (D. δέ, pg. 162).

βέλτιον: Singular, neuter, accusative irregular comparative of the adjective ἀγαθός used as an adverb (S. 319, 1606).

οὐχ ὡμολόγηται τοὺς ἄρχοντας τοῖς ἀρχομένοις προστάττοντας ποιεῖν ἄττα ἐνίοτε διαμαρτάνειν τοῦ ἑαυτοῖς βελτίστου, ἃ δ᾿ ἂν προστάττωσιν οἱ ἄρχοντες, δίκαιον εἶναι τοῖς ἀρχομένοις ποιεῖν; **(339.d)**

ἄν: *would.*
ἀρχόμενος, -ομένου, ὁ: *he who is ruled, the ruled.*
ἄρχων, -οντος, ὁ: *he* or *the one who rules, a ruler.*
ἄττα: see τις.
βελτίστον, -ου, τό: *the best, what is best.*
δέ: *and.*
διαμαρτάνω: *to fail utterly.*
δίκαιον, -ου, τό: *justice, the right* or *lawful.*
ἑαυτοῦ, -ῆς, -οῦ: *of himself, herself, itself.*

εἰμί: *to be.*
ἐνίοτε: *at times, sometimes.*
ὁμολογέομαι: *to be agreed upon, allowed by common consent.*
ὅς, ἥ, ὅ: *who, which, what.*
οὐ: *not.*
ποιέω: *to make, do.*
προστάττω: *to command, order.*
τις, τι: *anyone, anything, someone, something.*

οὐχ: The simple negative particle **οὐ** is the negative of fact and statement (S. 2688). The -**χ** is added to **οὐ** before a rough breathing (S. 137). When **οὐ** introduces a direct question, the answer "yes" is expected (S. 2651).

ὡμολόγηται: Third person, singular, perfect, passive indicative of **ὁμολογέω** (S. 390). Main verb of the complex sentence (S. 2173). Quasi-impersonal verb with two infinitive phrases functioning as the subject (S. 1984-85).

τοὺς … βελτίστου: The infinitive phrase functions as the first subject of the quasi-impersonal verb **ὡμολόγηται** (S. 1984).

τοὺς ἄρχοντας … προστάττοντας: Accusative subject of the infinitive **διαμαρτάνειν** (S. 1972).

τοὺς ἄρχοντας: Plural, masculine, accusative, present, active attributive participle of **ἄρχω** used substantively with the article (S. 1153.b, 2050). Participles used substantively admit distinctions of voice and tense; the present tense denotes continual action (S. 1153.b, 1872.a). **προστάττοντας**: Plural, masculine, accusative, present, active circumstantial participle of **προστάττω** modifying **ἄρχοντας** (S. 2054). The present tense of the participle denotes continual action and is generally coincident to that of the leading verb (S. 1872.a). Attic has -**ττ**- for -**σσ**- of Ionic and most other dialects (S. 78).

τοῖς ἀρχομένοις: Plural, masculine, dative, present, passive attributive participle of **ἄρχω** used substantively with the article (S. 1153.b, 2050). Dative object of the participle **προστάττοντας** (S. 1464, 2040). Participles used substantively admit distinctions of voice and tense; the present tense denotes continual action (S. 1153.b, 1872.a).

ποιεῖν: Present, active infinitive of **ποιέω** (S. 385). An object (complimentary) infinitive after **προστάττοντας** (S. 2000). The present tense of the infinitive denotes continual action (S. 1865).

ἄττα: Plural, neuter, accusative non-enclitic form (for **τινά**) of the indefinite pronoun **τις** used substantively (S. 334.a, 1266). Accusative direct object of the infinitive **ποιεῖν** (S. 1554, 1967).

ἐνίοτε: Adverb (S. 341, 1094).