Identifying Factors in Human Trafficking

by

Patrice M. Broderick


DISSERTATION.COM

Boca Raton, Florida
USA • 2005
IDENTIFYING FACTORS IN HUMAN TRAFFICKING

By

Patrice M. Broderick

A Thesis respectfully submitted

To

Dr. Hal Campbell

Florida Metropolitan University Online

In partial fulfillment for the degree of

Master of Science in Criminal Justice

2 April 2005

© 2005 Patrice M. Broderick

All rights reserved. This work may not be reproduced in whole or part, by photocopy or by other means, without permission of the author.
Give me your tired, your poor,
Your huddled masses yearning to breathe free,
The wretched refuse of your teeming shore.
Send these, the homeless, tempest-tossed to me:
I lift my lamp beside the golden door.

-Emma Lazarus

Inscription on Statue of Liberty
This thesis reviews the transnational problem of human trafficking, a form of slavery. Women and children are trafficked within and between countries at an alarming rate and it has become a prime agenda for the Bush Administration and the Department of State to call for action and solutions to. This thesis opens with a defining of this problem and overview of the scope of the problem on a global scale. It reviews social, political and economic factors which play a role. It describes laws enacted and police responses and describes what research has been conducted to get a grasp of what is involved and what might be done.

This author decided to explore factors that other researchers have suggested are “compelling factors” in victimization. This research hypothesis for this thesis explores the economic factors. Comparisons are made between countries of origin where victims originate from and destination countries where they are trafficked to.

The research findings reveal some significant differences in economic factors exist between the origin and destination countries. The findings lend support in why victims
feel compelled to seek entrance to countries like the U.S. and Australia or U.K. and might be easy prey for traffickers. This author makes it clear that the research here does not mean that this is why they are victimized. Further research with victim surveys and victim interviews will be helpful. Furthermore, it will be valuable to conduct more exploration of the economic factors, but more accurate data sources are needed. It is recommended that countries attempt to establish more standardized criteria for reporting economic data.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express praise to Almighty God for his gracious abundance of his love for giving me the gift of writing, to use me as an instrument to convey information to others of this hurtful pervasive crime against His people. Secondly, I wish to express my gratitude to my parents for their genes related to compassion and writing abilities. I am thankful to my thesis advisor, Dr. Hal Campbell, PhD, for all his advise and assistance throughout this difficult and sometimes trying project as I encountered first hand what the thesis process is supposed to teach about the “how to” of conducting research properly and how one relinquishes control when one uses secondary sources and or uses sources requiring permissions. Along those same lines, I owe thanks to Sarah Harrison of the InterUniversity Consortium for Political and Social Research for helping me as I tried to obtain restricted victim data, even though it wasn’t possible for me to obtain it. I at least learned the process that is involved for students and for other researchers. I am grateful to my fellow classmates for their support and encouragement along the way.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

PAGE

EPIGRAPH .............................................................................................................. ii
ABSTRACT ........................................................................................................... iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ....................................................................................... iv
TABLE OF CONTENTS ....................................................................................... v

CHAPTER

I. INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................... 1

II. NEED FOR THE STUDY ................................................................................ 3

   A. Purpose ......................................................................................................... 3

   B. Research Hypothesis .................................................................................... 3

   C. Theoretical Framework ................................................................................ 4

III. LITERATURE REVIEW ................................................................................... 7

   A. Defining Concepts ....................................................................................... 7

   B. Facts ............................................................................................................ 8

   C. Scope of the Problem ................................................................................... 9

   D. Economic Factors ....................................................................................... 13

   E. Victim Experiences/ Case Studies ............................................................... 17
F. Media Portrayal.........................................................................................25
G. Internet Pornography...............................................................................26
H. Tsunami Disaster......................................................................................26
I. Law Enforcement Response...................................................................27
J. Laws Enacted..........................................................................................29
K. International Responses.........................................................................33
L. U.S. Department of State..........................................................................34
IV. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY...............................................................36
   A. Design and Samples.............................................................................36
   B. Statistical Analysis...............................................................................37
V. DISCUSSION............................................................................................40
VI. INTERPRETATIONS, CONCLUSIONS, LIMITATIONS.......................41
VII. RECOMMENDATIONS...........................................................................43
VIII. REFERENCES.......................................................................................46
IX. APPENDICES..........................................................................................51
    Appendix A. Percentages Reported on Economic and Literacy Variables...51
    Appendix B. Statistical Comparisons.......................................................52
CHAPTER I
INTRODUCTION

The poor, homeless, wretched immigrants that the inscription on our landmark Statue of Liberty invites here to our land, are the focus of this thesis that reviews the transnational problem of human trafficking, a form of slavery that is quickly growing throughout the world. Women and children of other countries become victims unwittingly, simply because they sought to better themselves by seeking a job, believing what they were told, and became entrapped in a smuggling ring. They become trafficked for the purpose of agricultural labor, prostitution, sex tourism, pornography and other sexual services. The current estimate on the number of trafficking cases indicate that there are close to a million women and children trafficked annually around the world, with roughly 50,000 of these trafficked into the United States (Hughes, 2000; McGill, 2003; OVM, 2000). The actual rate may be much higher since this is an illegal activity and data is difficult to obtain. The problem of human trafficking is not race specific and anyone may become a victim.

This paper will define and explore the nature of human trafficking to attempt to educate those who have or will have contact with the victims and/or their traffickers
and/or are in a position to have an effect on current interventions for this disturbingly pervasive crime. There is a need for better identification of the trafficking victims. Some researchers have identified economic factors as contributing “vulnerability factors” that make these women and children more at risk, as well as other demographic and sociological factors (Bales, 1999; First World Congress, 1996; Hennick & Simkhada, 2004; Hughes, 2000; Rachawong, 2003). This paper probes into the economic features further. Factors about how our global economy works may provide some clues to how changes within economic structures can influence abatement in human trafficking crimes.
CHAPTER II
NEED FOR THE STUDY

Purpose

The purpose for this research study is twofold; informative and exploratory. My first purpose is to educate others employed in criminal justice fields and the community about the nature and extent of the human trafficking problem so that it is possible for others to recognize who the victims among them are and what the risk factors are that can make them more vulnerable. This information should help to enhance the collaborative efforts of law enforcement and social services to bring better help to the victims. It can provide clues as well about how the traffickers operate, using the vulnerable.

The second purpose of this thesis and reason for the selected hypothesis is to further explore how economic factors can play a significant role in why such slavery continues in the world today and how trafficking in human beings helps the global economy. This enlightened grasp of the situation will help readers understand the intricacies that make it tough to correct, but can give a new direction to focusing solutions that aim at correcting the economic imbalances.

Research Hypothesis

Other researchers have identified that economic factors play a key role in why women
and girls may be victimized by traffickers. Information in the way of interviews and surveys showed victims came from more economically deprived countries. For this thesis, this hypothesis was tested: There is a statistically significant difference between victims’ countries of origin and receiving countries on economic factors of poverty, unemployment, gini index, income, and the factor of literacy.

Theoretical Framework

Theory is a very important underpinning to any research conducted. It supplies the answers to our questions, like why criminals, such as traffickers, behave as they do, and why victims behave as they do and are targeted. Theory gives insight into what is occurring in a research study. A couple of popular crime theories and two victimization theories can give clarity as you proceed through the literature review and research conducted here.

The well-known conflict theory of crime seems applicable to this research topic. In this particular framework, “deviance is conceptualized not as abnormal behavior brought on by faulty socialization or normative ambiguity, but as a normal political process brought about by intergroup struggle for dominance (Keel, 2003)”. This theory has been further expanded by George Vold, who discussed the nature of group struggle. He reminds us how we are naturally social beings, and groups are formed out of our interests.
and needs. The interests and needs of groups interact and a competition results in order to maintain or to expand a person’s social position “relative to others in control of necessary resources (money, education, employment, etc). This competition is expressed in a political struggle (Keel, 2003).” Applying that to this issue, this can be seen in how sex traffickers interact with corrupt government officials and provide a supply for another country’s demand.

Another theory regarding criminal personality, that can be tied to this type of criminal, is that of Yochelson & Samenow. Their theory is grounded in the idea that the criminal acts with free will, he/she is self-centered and self-seeking, driven by fears and anger (the anger can explain how the pimps abuse victims who don’t comply), and choose a lifestyle “freely in his quest for power, control, and excitement (Barger,1980)”.

The victim precipitation theory appears to fit with trafficking, specifically in terms of passive precipitation. Passive precipitation relates to power imbalance. It is owing to some personal characteristics of the victim that they are singled out for attack and manipulation. Attaining economic power is one significant gain. (Siegel, 2003).

We could also apply the victim theory known as routine activities theory because three components are present and these are: the availability of suitable targets, absence of capable guardians (families may sell them off, police may be corrupt, and victims are
taken far from home), and presence of motivated offenders (trafficking rings). Predatory crime is more likely when all these components exist. (Siegel, 2003).

We will see how economic disparity is involved in the trafficking crimes. The idea of passive precipitation would suggest that it is owing to their powerless position in society where they originate from countries of economic oppression, that women and children can become easy prey for traffickers.

A new field of criminal profiling is developing in which the profilers look at long term patterns of behavior and utilize such information to guide an investigation that will help to get justice for society and its victims. Features of psychopathic behavior can be seen in some criminals that can aid us in understanding traffickers and their selection of victims. Not all criminals are psychopaths however, as Hare (1993) has pointed out. Psychopaths can be found occupying positions of trust in society and they use such positions to manipulate and prey upon unsuspecting, innocent victims for their own personal gain. They can be glib and charming and difficult to spot, but they bring devastation upon many lives. They can and do ignore society’s rules as impediments to fulfilling their desires for personal and economic gain. (Hare, 1993).
CHAPTER III

REVIEW OF THE LITERATURE

Concepts Defined

Before delving into this topic, it is essential to define key concepts for the reader. It is according to the Trafficking Victims Protection Act of 2000, that human trafficking has been defined as “the recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, or obtaining of a person for labor or services, through the use of force, fraud or coercion for the purpose of subjection to involuntary servitude, peonage, debt bondage, or slavery (OVW, 2000).”

Specifically, sex trafficking is expressed as “the recruitment, harboring, transportation, provision, or obtaining of a person for the purpose of a commercial sex act (OVW, 2000)”

Furthermore, it is classified as a severe form when “a commercial sex act is induced by force, fraud or coercion, or in which the person induced to perform such an act has not attained 18 years of age (OVW, 2000). Other important terms such as coercion, debt bondage, involuntary servitude, and peonage were defined by the act.

“Coercion means (A) threats of serious harm to or physical restraint by any person; (B) any scheme, plan, or pattern intended to cause a person to believe that failure to perform an act would result in serious harm to or physical restraint against any person; or (C) the abuse or threatened abuse of the legal process (OVW, 2000)”.

7
“Debt bondage means the status or condition of a debtor arising from a pledge by the debtor of his or her personal services or of those of a person under his or her control as a security for debt, if the value of those services as reasonably assessed is not applied toward liquidation of the debt or the length and nature of those services are not respectively limited and defined (OVW, 2000)”.

“Involuntary servitude includes a condition of servitude induced by means of (A) any scheme, plan or pattern intended to cause a person to believe that, if the person did not enter into or continue in such a condition, that person or another person would suffer serious harm or physical restraint; or (B) the abuse or threatened abuse of the legal process (OVW, 2000)”.

“The term peonage means holding someone against his or her will to pay off a debt (OVW, 2000)”.

It is important to note that it requires that severe forms of trafficking of persons be committed in order for TVPA to enact criminal penalties against traffickers or to offer victim services.

Facts

Here are some findings that Congress made. With regard to this current manifestation of slavery, there are an estimated 700,000 persons, mainly women and children, who are
annually trafficked across and within international borders. Each year, an estimated 50,000 women and children are trafficked into the U.S. There are a high number of trafficking victims related to the international sex trade. The sexual exploitation of girls and women are concerned with prostitution, pornography, sex tourism, and other commercial sex services. In this report, the low status of women is linked with contributing to this trafficking problem. According to this report, girls and women are primary targets and it is those “disproportionately affected by poverty, the lack of access to education, chronic unemployment, discrimination, and the lack of economic opportunities in the country of origin (OVW, 2000)”.

Scope of the Problem

Slavery and bondage of women and children are by no means a new problem, but dates back to Biblical times. Most familiar to us is the slavery of Israelites in Moses day with the killing of many Hebrew children. The book of Isaiah promised that “the Lord will end the bondage of his people. He will break the yoke of slavery and lift it up from their shoulders (Isaiah, 10, 27)”. Yet, many men, women and children still live in slavery and bondage today.

According to journalist Craig, McGill, in the year 2001, an estimated one million legal immigrants arrived in the United States; and in this number 411,059 obtained their visas
from U.S. consuls overseas and another 653,259 obtained Green Cards here in our country through Adjustment of Status. Everyone wants to come to America. A large number of arrivals had relatives residing in the U.S. and about 179,195 came in search of jobs. McGill reports that asylum seeking accounted for the second lowest number of arrivals, with 108,506 refugees being allowed in. (McGill, 2003). The smallest number, 42,015 immigrants, are accounted for due to America’s visa lottery scheme. The following states receive more than half of the immigrants—California (282,957), New York (114,116), Florida (104,715), Texas (86,315), New Jersey (59,920), and Illinois (48,296). Most of the immigrants come from Mexico (206,426), India (70,290), China (56,426), Philippines (53,154), and Vietnam (35,531). At least in regard to the immigrants going into Europe, McGill says that in the report for the Director-General for Justice and Home Affairs at the European Commission, it was observed that ‘push factors’ like war and repression are higher driving factors for asylum seekers than are ‘pull factors’ defined as economic hardship or Europe’s benefit systems. Germany has been an appealing spot for Kurdish and Turkish Immigrants. Since September 11th, Afghanistan immigrants fled the Taliban. (McGill, 2003).

Worldwide, men, women and children are trafficked for the purpose of performing forced labor of all types, including agriculture, domestic service, construction work, and
sweatshops, in addition to trafficking for commercial sexual exploitation. (Trafficking in Persons Report 2003, McGill, 2003, Bales, 1999). Even human organs are sold in the effort to enter another country. (McGill, 2003). It should be pointed out that this is not a race specific problem. Anyone’s sister, mother or little brother can be trafficked from all corners of the globe.

The problem of sex slavery has been of ever increasing concern around the globe. (Bales, 1999; Hughes, 2000; Klueber, 2003; McGill, 2003; Office of Violence Against Women, 2000). Klueber’s thesis reports that recent estimates by the Department of State reveal there are roughly 700,000 to one million women and children trafficked annually worldwide and of this number, 50,000 of these are trafficked into and within the USA. Klueber stated that in addition to this estimated 50,000, there are between 100,000 to 300,000 children that are sexually exploited through prostitution and pornography in the U.S., as conveyed by the organization End Child Prostitution, Child Pornography, and the Trafficking of Children for Sexual Exploitation (EPCAT, 1996). A deplorable reality is that young children are preferred for the sex industry due to a belief that they are less likely to carry the HIV virus. See Disposable People, Chapter 2, Thailand: Because She Looks Like a Child. (Bales, 1999).

McGill, too, gives a similar estimate of 50,000 females arriving in America for such
exploitation, according to the CIA. Most of the prostitutes in the USA are not from this country. The UK has also seen a tremendous rise in the last few years. Close to 30,000 girls and women entered the UK from other countries, forcibly, to sell their bodies, the Home Office reported. Furthermore, greater than 5,000 are sadly girls under 16 years of age. (McGill, 2003).

Young girls and women leave their homes thinking they will be dancers or that they will be obtaining legitimate jobs in some area or believing that the international dating agencies and the mail-order bride agencies are legitimate. Traffickers con them and these women find themselves, after enduring a long, uncomfortable journey, trapped in a hell hole selling their bodies, unable to escape their keepers and forced to take drugs, or they acquiesce to drugs to numb them, since they are unable to escape their fate.

What makes these women and children so vulnerable to traffickers? The literature reveals a number of factors which place them at a higher risk. These factors include gender, low status of women, poverty, low education level, government corruption and weak legislative frameworks, function of demand for sexual services, family breakdown, family economic needs, involvement of other family member, drug use, abuse at home, cultural beliefs, materialism, (First World Congress, 1996) war and lack of a promising future (Hughes, 2000). This thesis will further examine factors both qualitatively in a
What is the profile of traffickers? The literature review shows that organized crime syndicates are involved and smuggling rings (Klueber, 2003, McGill, 2003) i.e. by border “coyotes”, and smaller gangster groups (Malarek, 2003), but often the principal way into the trade is through a family member or friend (Hughes, 2001, McGill, 2003). It is fairly typical that middlemen are owners of legitimate businesses, and esteemed, who also own brothels. (Bales, 1999, Klueber, 2003). Generally traffickers are males above 30 years old (Sen & Nair, 2003). Corrupt police and military contribute to aiding the problem (Bales, 1999, Malarek, 2003) and a Human Rights Watch researcher, Vandenberg, felt that, “The human rights violation of trafficking in persons cannot flourish without the complicity of indifferent and corrupt state officials (Malarek, 2003)”.

**Economic Factors**

Trafficking in human beings is a profitable business and it has been identified by various researchers (Bales, 1999, Hughes, 2001, King, 2004) that socio/economic factors are plainly key explanatory variables. Gilbert King referred to it as a “$12 billion a year global industry (2004)”. It is hard to imagine how slavery continues to exist today until we familiarize ourselves with the supply and demand issues in a world context, how such trafficking is an important source of income for many countries, and see the tying with
corrupt officials. It is enormously profitable for traffickers, and police take little action, can be corrupt, or may be unskilled at recognizing it and instituting policies as Klueber’s study on police departments (2003) illustrates. It has been estimated that 9.5 billion US dollars in revenue is produced annually, according to the June 2004 Trafficking in Persons Report. Other estimates have been higher.

Victims pay and then keep on paying. People are willing to pay a lot in order to come to the United States or other destination countries and they come with the belief they will find legitimate jobs promised to them. They might pay a person or group a fee of $40,000 and then once in the country find out they aren’t going to get the promised job, but are, instead, forced into prostitution. They are in a situation of debt bondage, in which they must work until their debt is paid, at which time they may be released or they may find that the debt is never paid off. More debt can be incurred for non-compliance.

Tupman (Pearce, 2000) identified push and pull factors connected with immigration and provide incentives for trafficking of humans. Factors that push people away from their country toward another have consisted of: escaping war or persecution, violence, poverty, environmental disasters and human rights violations. The pull factors bringing people toward certain countries, often in the west, are related to demand for cheap labor in a variety of areas, like domestic service, agricultural work and the sex industry.
Traffickers can easily sell their human “cargo” because of this demand for cheap labor. The demand leads to involvement of more people in trafficking until they become larger operations and networks of individual or organized crime. (Pearce, 2000). People are the third largest illegal commodity traded, preceded by drugs and firearms. Often drugs and weapons are smuggled with women and children.

One point about poverty is that people do what they must to survive, and Dayo Elizabeth Akinmoyo, in her keynote address at a conference in London, United Kingdom, made the observation that in Nigerian culture of communal lifestyle, people can cease to think in terms of “we” or think of neighbors, and would focus on “I”. She explains how poor families would begin “to release their children (even at cost) to anyone who promised to migrate them to the city or overseas. She explained how it can occur that criminals would seize this opportunity to exploit the vulnerable because of their economic hardship and their level of illiteracy.

Just think of the ways people get rich by owning slaves, without official acknowledgement of ownership and its subsequent responsibility, albeit minimal, as in the slavery days of the Old South. Kevin Bates, in Disposable People (1999) brings it so shockingly to our attention just how profitable and how cheap human life has become. He says, “People become completely disposable tools for making money (1999)”. Having
ownership doesn’t involve any owning of papers necessarily, but they do have control over their property, and it is generally insured through violence.

Bales (1999), speaking of sex trade in Thailand, describes just how profitable contract debt bondage can be.

A girl between twelve and fifteen years old can be purchased for $800 to $2,000, and the costs of running a brothel and feeding the girls are relatively low. The profit is often as high as 800 percent a year. This kind of return can be made on a girl for five to ten years. After that, especially if she becomes ill or HIV-positive, the girl is dumped. (Bales, 1999, 18-19).

He expressed how slave ownership and slave trade has next to no economic control to deal with this kind of financial wrongdoing.

Population and economic growth are interrelated. With population explosions, extremes of poverty can readily be seen. When faced with the need of cash to buy medicine and food and when lacking in education, it becomes so easy to fall prey to traffickers with bogus contracts, making offers. Women and families that are destitute get into enslavement and debt bondage. In the global economy, Bales (1999) feels that, “Given the penetration of multinational companies into developing countries, that debt might mean a slave is ultimately serving a global business.” Food for thought. The links