

**BOOK 1 OF PLATO'S REPUBLIC:
A WORD BY WORD GUIDE
TO TRANSLATION
(VOL 2: CHAPTERS 13–24)**

**BOOK 1 OF PLATO'S REPUBLIC:
A WORD BY WORD GUIDE
TO TRANSLATION
(VOL 2: CHAPTERS 13–24)**

DREW A. MANNETTER



BrownWalker Press
Irvine • Boca Raton

Book 1 of Plato's Republic: A Word by Word Guide to Translation (Vol 2: Chapters 13–24)

Copyright © 2018 Drew A. Mannerter

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, distributed, or transmitted in any form or by any means, including photocopying, recording, or other electronic or mechanical methods, without the prior written permission of the publisher, except in the case of brief quotations embodied in critical reviews and certain other noncommercial uses permitted by copyright law.

BrownWalker Press / Universal Publishers, Inc.

Irvine, Boca Raton

USA • 2018

www.brownwalker.com

978-1-62734-695-5 (pbk.)

978-1-62734-696-2 (ebk.)

Typeset by Medlar Publishing Solutions Pvt Ltd, India

Cover design by Ivan Popov

Publisher's Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Mannerter, Drew Arlen, 1962-

Book 1 of Plato's Republic: A Word by Word Guide to Translation (Vol 2: Chapters 13–24) /
Drew A. Mannerter.

pages cm

ISBN: 978-1-62734-695-5 (pbk.); 978-1-62734-696-2 (ebk.)

1. Plato. Republic. 2. Plato—Influence. 3. Philosophy—Study and teaching. 4. Latin
language. I. Title.

B395 .M265 2015

184—dc23

2017960252

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Notes on the Text	xviii
PART III: (339.b-342.e)	1
Socrates criticizes Thrasymachus' claim that "justice is the interest of the stronger" by showing that rulers sometimes make errors and enjoin harmful things for themselves. Thrasymachus defends his position with an ad hoc argument that real rules never make errors. Socrates attacks his definition by arguing that the practitioner of any art (medicine, pilot, etc.) aims for the good of the object of his art (patient, sailor, etc.) and not the good for himself and, therefore, the aim of the ruler is not his own good but that of the ruled.	
III.1: (339.b-340.a)	3
Socrates argues that if justice is both the advantage of the stronger and the ruled doing what is ordered, every time a ruler makes a mistake and orders something contrary to his own good, it turns out that the ruled must do something that is disadvantageous to the ruler.	
III.2: (340.a-340.c)	24
Cleitophon defends Thrasymachus' position by watering it down to the rulers doing what they assume to be in their interest. Polemarchus points out that this was not Thrasymachus' position.	
III.3: (340.c-341.c)	38
Thrasymachus defends his position by denying that any craftsman errors while practicing his craft (for example, a doctor who misdiagnosis a patient is not a doctor but a quack). Therefore, the real ruler will never err and consequently will never mistake his own interest.	
III.4: (341.c-342.e)	74
Socrates does not specifically argue against Thrasymachus' assertion that a craftsman never errs but instead defines what the nature of an art is. He shows that by its very nature an art is not concerned with the good of itself since the art is perfect in its nature, but with the good of its object. A doctor uses the medical art to heal the sick and horsemanship looks out for the interest of horses; likewise, by analogy with other arts, the ruler uses the ruling art for the good of his subjects and not for the good of his art or himself.	

PART IV: (343.a-347.e) 121

Thrasymachus iterates that the real aim of the political art is the enrichment of the powerful class. He goes further and maintains that the unjust man will always have the advantage over the just man in public and private dealings. He claims that injustice is more powerful than justice if it is practiced on a large enough scale. Socrates maintains that no one willingly rules but pay, in the form of money, honor, or a penalty, must be added. Socrates elaborates on the nature of the penalty.

IV.1: (343.a-344.c) 123

Thrasymachus delivers a defense of his position based on real world evidence. Rulers treat the ruled like shepherds treat sheep and profit off of them. The unjust man always does better than the just man in civic and private engagements. An unjust man will become a tyrant with complete control of a city and be admired by everyone for it.

IV.2: (344.d-347.e) 167

Thrasymachus attempts to depart after his speech but the company detains him. Socrates again argues that the true ruler does not rule with his own good in mind but that of the ruled. In order to get men to rule, pay is added in the form of the wage earner's art. A doctor will practice both arts, that of medicine which heals patients and the wage earning art by which he gets paid. The same holds for the politician who also demands pay: wages, honor, or a penalty. The penalty is being ruled by a worse man than oneself if one does not consent to rule.

PART V: (347.e-350.d) 261

Socrates takes up the new question of whether the life of an unjust man is better than that of the just man. Thrasymachus maintains that injustice is virtue and wisdom and justice vice and ignorance. Socrates constructs an argument from analogy to prove that the just man is good and wise and the unjust man bad and ignorant and consequently that justice is virtue and wisdom and injustice is vice and ignorance.

V.1: (347.e-349.b) 263

Socrates takes up Thrasymachus' assertion that the life of the unjust man is superior to that of the just man. Thrasymachus maintains that injustice is virtue and wisdom while justice is vice and ignorance.

V.2: (349.b-350.d) 307

Socrates constructs an analogy argument based on Thrasymachus' admission that the unjust man would want to overreach both the unjust and just man while the just man would only want to overreach the unjust man but not the just man. The musical and medical man (whom Thrasymachus admits are wise and good) are shown to want to overreach only the non-musical and non-medical man. The non-musical and non-medical man (whom Thrasymachus admits are ignorant and bad) will want to overreach both their like and opposite. By analogy then, the unjust man is like the non-musical and non-medical man (ignorant and bad) and the just man like the musical and medical man (wise and good). By extension, justice is virtue and wisdom and injustice vice and ignorance. Thrasymachus' position is defeated and this defeat is dramatically portrayed by his blushing.

PART VI: (350.d-352.d)**357**

Socrates addresses the next question: is injustice more powerful than justice? Thrasymachus refuses to argue further and simply answers Socrates' questions. Socrates turns to the analogy of a city to examine whether it would be more powerful with justice or injustice. He argues that injustice leads to factions in a city and factions to weakness. The same is true on the individual level.

PART VII: (352.d-354.a)**423**

Socrates addresses the final question: whether the just or the unjust man lead happier lives. Socrates constructs an argument from analogy that everything has a proper function and virtue (for example, the function of the eyes is to see and the virtue is sight). The soul also has a proper function (rule) and a virtue (justice) as opposed to a bad soul will have a defective function (mismanagement) and vice (injustice). The just man is thus happy and the unjust man miserable.

CONCLUSION: (354.a-354.c)**473**

Despite all the discussion, the core question remains of what justice is. Without that fundamental question answered, Socrates cannot hope to know anything about it and the discussion ends with the familiar Socratic claim to complete ignorance.

NOTES ON THE TEXT

The reader should be familiar with the following conventions and terms.
Capital letters in the Greek text indicate a change of interlocutor.

Punctuation (S. 188):

Greek , (comma) = English , (comma).

Greek . (period) = English . (period).

Greek . (point above the line) = English : and ; (colon and semicolon).

Greek ; (semicolon) = English ? (question mark).

Accents (S. 138-87):

Acute: ´

Circumflex: ˆ

Grave: `

Syllables:

The last syllable is called the *ultima*: σοφός.

The next to the last syllable is called the *penult*: νόμος.

The one before the penult is called the *antepenult*: άνθρωπος.

Words are named according to their accent as follows:

Oxytone (acute on the ultima): θήρ, καλός, λευκός.

Paroxytone (acute on the penult): λύω, λείπω, λευκός.

Proparoxytone (acute on the antepenult): άνθρωπος, παδεύομεν.

Perispomenon (circumflex on the ultima): γῆ, θεοῦ.

Properispomenon (circumflex on the penult): πράξις, μούσα.

Abbreviations in the citations:

S.:

Smyth, Herbert Weir, *Greek Grammar*. Revised by Gordon M. Messing. Harvard University Press. 1984.

D.:

Denniston, J.D., *The Greek Particle*. Second Edition revised by K.J. Dover. Hackett Publishing Company, Inc.. Indianapolis/Cambridge.1991.

L. and S.:

Liddell and Scott, *An Intermediate Greek Dictionary*. Oxford at the Clarendon Press, Oxford University Press, 1986.

Liddell and Scott, *A Greek-English Lexicon*. Oxford at the Clarendon Press, Oxford University Press, 1968.

Other sources:

The Greek text was taken from *The Republic of Plato. Edited with Critical Notes, Commentary and Appendices*. James Adam, M.A.. Vol. 1. Cambridge at the University Press, 1902. This can be accessed at the web site: Tarik Wareh public-domain classics books – Union College (WWW1.union.edu/wareh/books).



PART III: (339.b-342.e)

Socrates criticizes Thrasymachus' claim that "justice is the interest of the stronger" by showing that rulers sometimes make errors and enjoin harmful things for themselves. Thrasymachus defends his position with an ad hoc argument that real rules never make errors. Socrates attacks his definition by arguing that the practitioner of any art (medicine, pilot, etc.) aims for the good of the object of his art (patient, sailor, etc.) and not the good for himself and, therefore, the aim of the ruler is not his own good but that of the ruled.

III.1: (339.b-340.a)

Socrates argues that if justice is both the advantage of the stronger and the ruled doing what is ordered, every time a ruler makes a mistake and orders something contrary to his own good, it turns out that the ruled must do something that is disadvantageous to the ruler.

XIII. Ταῦτ' ἔσται, ἦν δ' ἐγώ. καί μοι εἰπέ· οὐ καὶ πείθεσθαι μέντοι τοῖς ἄρχουσι δίκαιον φησ εἶναι; Ἔγωγε. (339.b-c)

ἄρχων, -οντος, ὁ: *he or the one who rules, a ruler.*

δέ: *and.*

δίκαιον, -ου, τό: *justice, the right or lawful.*

ἐγώ, ἐμοῦ: *I, of me.*

ἔγωγε, ἐμοῦγε: *I at least, for my part, for myself.*

εἰμί: *to be.*

εἶπον: *to speak, say.*

ἡμί: *to say.*

καί: *and now, just; also, too.*

οὐ ... μέντοι: *do you not surely?*

οὔτος, αὕτη, τοῦτο: *this man, woman, or thing.*

πείθεσθαι: *to listen to, obey.*

φημί: *to say, affirm, assert.*

Ταῦτ': Plural, neuter, nominative pronoun used substantively; the antecedent is the proposed examination of Thrasymachus' idea (S. 1238, 1245). Nominative subject of **ἔσται** (S. 927, 938). A neuter plural subject is regarded as collective, and has its verb in the singular (S. 958). Elision of **Ταῦτα** (S. 70).

ἔσται: Third person, singular, future, indicative of **εἰμί** (S. 768). Main verb of the simple sentence (S. 903).

ἦν δ' ἐγώ: This phrase introduces the *oratio recta* (S. 2590). **ἦν**: First person, singular, imperfect, indicative of **ἡμί** (S. 792). Main verb of the introductory phrase (S. 903). The irregular verb only occurs in the present and imperfect 1st and 3^d singular (= Latin **inquam, inquit**) (S. 792).

δ': Postpositive conjunction connecting this sentence with the previous one; the copulative **δέ** marks transition, and is the ordinary particle used in connecting successive clauses or sentences which add something new or different, but not opposed, to what precedes, and are not joined by other particles, such as **γάρ** or **οὖν** (S. 2835-2836). "As a connective, **δέ** denotes either pure connection 'and', or contrast, 'but', with all that lies between" (D. 162). An elision of **δέ** (S. 70). **ἐγώ**: Singular, nominative of the personal pronoun **ἐγώ** (S. 325). Nominative

subject of ἦν (S. 927, 938). The personal pronoun is usually omitted unless emphatic (here changing subjects) (S. 1190). An acute, when not immediately followed by another word, does not change to a grave (S. 154).

καί: The conjunction connects this sentence with the previous one; with the imperative, the conjunction can mean “and now, just” (S. 2868, 2873). The acute accent on the oxytone is not changed to a grave when followed by an enclitic (S. 154.a).

μοι: Singular, dative, enclitic form of the personal pronoun ἐγώ (S. 325). Dative indirect object of εἰπέ (S. 1471). The enclitic pronoun loses its accent after the oxytone καί (S. 181).

εἰπέ: Second person, singular, aorist, active imperative of εἶπον (S. 385). Main verb of the simple sentence (S. 903). The subject οὐ is not expressed but implied in the verb; the nominative of the personal pronoun is usually omitted except when emphatic (S. 929, 1190). The aorist tense of the imperative denotes simple occurrence (S. 1864.b). The accent on this form of the verb is oxytone (S. 424.b). An acute, when not immediately followed by another word, does not change to a grave (S. 154).

οὐ ... μέντοι: The combination of particles expects a positive answer (S. 2918.a). **οὐ:** The simple negative particle οὐ is the negative of fact and statement (S. 2688). When οὐ introduces a direct question, the answer “yes” is expected (S. 2651). **μέντοι:** The postpositive particle marks the question as expecting a positive answer (as *nonne* in Latin) (S. 2917-18) (D. μέντοι, pg. 403).

καί: Adverbial use of the particle meaning “also” (S. 2881).

πείθεσθαι ... δίκαιον ... εἶναι: Accusative/infinitive in indirect discourse after φησ (S. 2592).

πείθεσθαι: Present, middle infinitive of πείθω (S. 383). Accusative subject of εἶναι; in definitions, the infinitive may be used as an accusative subject (S. 973, 1986). The present tense of the infinitive denotes continual action (S. 1865).

τοῖς ἄρχουσι: Plural, masculine, dative, present, active attributive participle of ἄρχω used substantively with the article (S. 1153.b, 2050). Dative direct object of the infinitive πείθεσθαι (S. 1464, 1967.b). Participles used substantively admit distinctions of voice and tense; the present tense denotes continual action (S. 1153.b, 1872.a).

δίκαιον: Singular, neuter, accusative of the adjective δίκαιος used substantively (S. 1021, 1023). Predicate accusative noun modifying πείθεσθαι after εἶναι (S. 910). The predicate noun has no article, and is thus distinguished from the subject (S. 1150).

φησ: Second person, singular, present, indicative of φημί (S. 783). Main verb of the complex sentence (S. 2173). The subject οὐ is not expressed but implied in the verb; the nominative of the personal pronoun is usually omitted except when emphatic (S. 929, 1190).

εἶναι: Present infinitive of εἶμι (S. 768). The infinitive in indirect discourse (S. 2016). Main verb of the indirect discourse. The infinitive represents a finite verb after verbs of saying and thinking; each tense of direct discourse is retained (with its proper meaning as regards stage of action) when it becomes infinitive in indirect discourse (S. 2019, 2022).

Ἐγώγε: Singular, nominative form of the personal pronoun ἐγώγε (S. 325.b). The suffix -γε attached to the pronoun ἐγώ makes it emphatic (S. 325.b). The compound of ἐγώ γε becomes a proparoxytone (S. 186.a). The word signifies a “yes” answer (S. 2680.b).

Πότερον δὲ ἀναμάρτητοί εἰσιν οἱ ἄρχοντες ἐν ταῖς πόλεσιν ἑκάσταις ἢ οἷό τι καὶ ἀμαρτεῖν; (339.c)

ἀμαρτάνω: *to fail of doing, fail, go wrong.*

ἀναμάρτητος, -ον: *without missing, unfailing, unerring.*

ἄρχων, -οντος, ὁ: *he or the one who rules, a ruler.*

δέ: *but.*

εἰμί: *to be.*

ἕκαστος, -η, -ον: *every, every one, each, each one.*

ἐν (+ dat.): *in.*

καί: *even.*

οἶος, οἶα, οἶον: *be able, possible, or capable.*

πόλις, -εως, ἡ: *city.*

πότερον ... ἢ: *whether ... or.*

τι: *somewhat, in any degree, at all.*

(λέγοις ἄν) Πότερον ... ἢ: The adverb and conjunction introduce direct alternative questions (S. 2656). Supply λέγοις ἄν (“tell me”) as the main verb of the sentence; in lively discourse the form of the verb signifying to speak may be omitted for brevity. The ellipsis is often unconscious and it is frequently uncertain what is to be supplied to complete the thought (S. 946, 1830).

Πότερον ... ἑκάσταις: First alternative direct question (S. 2656).

δέ: Postpositive conjunction connecting this sentence with the previous one; here the particle δέ has an adversative sense and serves to mark that something is different from what precedes, but only to offset it, not to exclude or contradict it (S. 2834-35). “As a connective, δέ denotes either pure connection ‘and,’ or contrast, ‘but,’ with all that lies between” (D. δέ, pg. 162).

ἀναμάρτητοί: Plural, nominative, masculine predicate adjective modifying οἱ ἄρχοντες after εἰσιν (S. 1040). The acute accent on the ultima syllable is thrown back from the following enclitic εἰσιν (S. 183.c).

εἰσιν: Third person, singular, present, indicative of εἰμί (S. 768). Main verb of the simple question (S. 903). The enclitic verb throws back its accent onto the previous proparoxytone ἀναμάρτητοί (S. 183.c). The moveable -ν is added to words ending in -σι when the next word begins with a vowel (S. 134).

οἱ ἄρχοντες: Plural, masculine, nominative, present, active attributive participle of ἄρχω used substantively with the article (S. 1153.b, 2050). Nominative subject of εἰσιν (S. 927, 938). Participles used substantively admit distinctions of voice and tense; the present tense denotes continual action (S. 1153.b, 1872.a).

ἐν ταῖς πόλεσιν ἑκάσταις: Prepositional phrase; ἐν with the dative (locative) here means “in” (S. 1687.1.a). ταῖς: The article is very often omitted in phrases containing a preposition but

- not here (S. 1128). **ἐκάσταις**: Plural, feminine, dative indefinite pronominal adjective modifying **πόλεσιν** (S. 337). **ἕκαστος** occupies the predicate position after the article and noun (S. 1179).
- ἦ ... ἄμαρτεῖν**: Second alternative direct question (S. 2656).
- οἰοί** {(ἐῖσί) = (οἰοί ἐῖσί)}: Plural, nominative, masculine relative pronoun (S. 340). Predicate nominative after the supplied verb **ἐῖσί** (S. 1040). The acute accent on the ultima syllable is thrown back from the following enclitic **τι** (S. 183.c). **ἐῖσί**: Supply **ἐῖσί** (“are they”) as the main verb of the simple question; the copulative verb **εἶναι** is often omitted (S. 944). The quasi-impersonal construction governs the infinitive (S. 1985).
- τι**: The singular, neuter, accusative of the indefinite pronoun is used adverbially (S. 341, 1094). The enclitic throws back its accent onto the previous properispomenon **οἰοί** (S. 183.c).
- καί**: Adverbial use of the particle meaning “even” (S. 2881).
- ἄμαρτεῖν**: Aorist, active infinitive of **ἄμαρτάνω** (S. 384). An object (complementary) infinitive after **οἰοί** (S. 2000). The aorist tense of the infinitive denotes simple occurrence (S. 1865.b).

Πάντως που, ἔφη οἰοί τι καὶ ἄμαρτεῖν. (339.c)

ἄμαρτάνω: *to fail of doing, fail, go wrong.*

καί: *even.*

οἶος, οἶα, οἶον: *be able, possible, or capable.*

πάντως: *yes, by all means.*

πού: *anyway, possibly, perhaps, I suppose.*

τι: *somewhat, in any degree, at all.*

φημί: *to say, affirm, assert.*

Πάντως: Confirmatory adverb (S. 2680).

που: Enclitic particle used to qualify the expression (L. S. **που** II). The monosyllabic enclitic loses its accent after the paroxytone **Πάντως** (S. 181).

ἔφη: Third person, singular, imperfect, indicative of **φημί** (S. 783). The verb introduces the *oratio recta* (S. 2590). The subject **ἐκεῖνος** (the antecedent is **ὁ Θρασύμαχος**) is not expressed but implied in the verb (S. 931).

οἰοί ... ἄμαρτεῖν: Words are often repeated in “yes” answers with the confirmatory adverb **Πάντως** (S. 2680).

οἰοί {(ἐῖσί) = (οἰοί ἐῖσί)}: Plural, nominative, masculine relative pronoun (S. 340). Predicate nominative after the supplied verb **ἐῖσί** (S. 1040). The acute accent on the ultima syllable is thrown back from the following enclitic **τι** (S. 183.c). **ἐῖσί**: Supply **ἐῖσί** (“they are”) as the main verb of the simple sentence; the copulative verb **εἶναι** is often omitted (S. 944). The quasi-impersonal construction governs the infinitive (S. 1985).

τι: The singular, neuter, accusative of the indefinite pronoun is used adverbially (S. 341, 1094). The enclitic throws back its accent onto the previous properispomenon **οἰοί** (S. 183.c).

καί: The particle is here used adverbially meaning “even” (S. 2881).

ἄμαρτεῖν: Aorist, active infinitive of **ἄμαρτάνω** (S. 384). An object (complementary) infinitive after **οἶοί** (S. 1989). The aorist tense of the infinitive denotes simple occurrence (S. 1865.b).

Οὐκοῦν ἐπιχειροῦντες νόμους τιθέναι τοὺς μὲν ὀρθῶς τιθέασι, τοὺς δὲ
τινας οὐκ ὀρθῶς; Οἶμαι ἔγωγε. (339.c)

ἔγωγε, ἐμοῦγε: *I at least, for my part, for myself.*

ἐπιχειρῶ: *to attempt, endeavor.*

νόμος, -ου, ὁ: *custom, law, ordinance.*

ὁ μὲν ... ὁ δέ: *on the one hand one ... on the other hand another.*

οἶμαι: *to think, suppose, believe.*

ὀρθῶς: *rightly, truly, correctly.*

οὐ: *not.*

οὐκοῦν: *therefore, then, accordingly, so then.*

τίθημι: *to lay down, give, make.*

τις, τι: *some.*

Οὐκοῦν ... τιθέασι: First coordinate clause (S. 2162).

Οὐκοῦν: Interrogative adverb introducing a direct question; here the stress lies on the inferential **οῦν** and an affirmative answer is expected as a matter of course. **οὐκοῦν** stands at the beginning of the clause (S. 2951).

ἐπιχειροῦντες: Plural, masculine, nominative, present, active, circumstantial participle of **ἐπιχειρῶ** modifying **ἐκεῖνοι**, the implied subject of **τιθέασι** (S. 2042, 2054). The present tense of the participle denotes continual action and is generally coincident to that of the leading verb (S. 1872.a).

νόμους: Accusative direct object of the infinitive **τιθέναι** (S. 1554, 1967.b). The noun lacks an article (S. 1126).

τιθέναι: Present, active infinitive of **τίθημι** (S. 416). An object (complimentary) infinitive after **ἐπιχειροῦντες** (S. 1989). The present tense of the infinitive denotes continual action (S. 1865).

τοὺς: Plural, masculine, accusative article used as a demonstrative pronoun meaning “some” (S. 1106). Accusative direct object of **τιθέασι** (S. 1554). The pronoun is in partitive apposition to **νόμους** (S. 981).

μὲν ... δέ: The two particles **μὲν ... δέ** draw a contrast between the two coordinate clauses (S. 2904).

δέ: The oxytone, followed by an enclitic, retains its accent and does not change from the acute to grave (S. 183.a).

ὀρθῶς: Adverb of manner (S. 343, 1094).

τιθέασι: Third person, plural, present, active, indicative of **τίθημι** (S. 416). Main verb of the simple coordinate clause (S. 2162). The subject **ἐκεῖνοι** (the antecedent is **οἱ ἄρχοντες**) is not expressed but implied in the verb (S. 931).

τοὺς ... ὀρθῶς: Second coordinate clause (S. 2162).

τοὺς ... τινὰς (τιθέασι): Accusative direct object of the supplied verb **τιθέασι** (S. 1554). **τοὺς:** Plural, masculine, accusative article used as a demonstrative pronoun meaning “others” (S. 1106). The pronoun is in partitive apposition to **νόμους** (S. 981). **τινὰς:** Plural, masculine, accusative indefinite pronoun used as an adjective modifying **τοὺς** (S. 1266). The enclitic pronoun loses its accent after the oxytone **δέ** (S. 183.a). **τιθέασι:** Carry down **τιθέασι** as the main verb of the second coordinate clause; when the main verb in both coordinate clauses is the same it is not normally repeated (S. 948).

οὐκ: The simple negative particle **οὐ** is the negative of fact and statement (S. 2688). The **-κ** is added to **οὐ** before a smooth breathing (S. 137).

ὀρθῶς: Adverb of manner (S. 343, 1094).

Οἶμαι: First person, singular, present, deponent, indicative of **οἶμαι** (S. 383). Main verb of the simple sentence (S. 903). An Attic contraction of **οἶομαι** (L.S. **οἶομαι**).

ἔγωγε: Singular, nominative form of the personal pronoun **ἔγωγε** (S. 325.b). Nominative subject of **Οἶμαι** (S. 927, 938). The suffix **-γε** attached to the pronoun **ἐγώ** makes it emphatic (S. 325.b). The compound of **ἐγώ γε** becomes a proparoxytone (S. 186.a).

Τὸ δὲ ὀρθῶς ἄρα τὸ τὰ ξυμφέροντά ἐστι τίθεσθαι ἑαυτοῖς, τὸ δὲ μὴ ὀρθῶς ἀξύμφορα; ἢ πῶς λέγεις; Οὕτως. (339.c)

ἀξύμφορον, -ου, τό: *an inexpedient or disadvantageous thing.*

ἄρα: *then? therefore?*

δέ: *and; but.*

ἑαυτοῦ, -ῆς, -οῦ: *of himself, herself, itself.*

εἰμί: *to be.*

ἢ: *or.*

λέγω: *to say, mean.*

μή: *not.*

ξυμφέροντα, -όντων, τά: *profit, advantage, interest.*

ὀρθῶς, τό, τοῦ: *the right way, the correct way.*

οὕτως: *in this way or manner, so, thus.*

πῶς: *how?*

τίθεμαι: *to make (for oneself).*

τό, τοῦ: *the.*

- Τὸ ... ἑαυτοῖς:** First coordinate clause (S. 2162).
- Τὸ ... ὀρθῶς:** Nominative subject of **ἔστι** (S. 927, 938). **Τὸ:** Singular, neuter, nominative article introducing the adverb (S. 1153.g). **ὀρθῶς:** Adverb; the adverb is made into a substantive by the addition of an article (S. 1153.g).
- δὲ:** Postpositive conjunction connecting this sentence with the previous one; the copulative **δέ** marks transition, and is the ordinary particle used in connecting successive clauses or sentences which add something new or different, but not opposed, to what precedes, and are not joined by other particles, such as **γάρ** or **οὖν** (S. 2835-2836). “As a connective, **δέ** denotes either pure connection ‘and,’ or contrast, ‘but,’ with all that lies between” (D. **δέ**, pg. 162).
- ἄρα:** The interrogative particle introduces the direct question (S. 2650).
- τὸ τὰ ξυμφέροντά ... τίθεσθαι ἑαυτοῖς:** Predicate nominative modifying **Τὸ ... ὀρθῶς** after **ἔστι** (S. 910).
- τὸ ... τίθεσθαι:** Articular infinitive (S. 2025). **τὸ:** Singular, neuter, nominative article used to introduce the infinitive (S. 2026). **τίθεσθαι:** Present, middle infinitive of **τίθημι** (S. 416). The present tense of the infinitive denotes continual action (S. 1865).
- τὰ ξυμφέροντά:** Plural, neuter, accusative, present, active attributive participle of **ξυμφέρω** used substantively with the article (S. 1153.b, 2050). Accusative direct object of the infinitive **τίθεσθαι** (S. 1554, 1967). The acute accent on the ultimate syllable of the properispomenon is thrown back from the following enclitic **ἔστι** (S. 183.c). A word or group of words standing between the article and its noun is an attributive (S. 1154). The participle used substantively may be used in the singular or plural to mean “profit, advantage” (L.S. **συμφέρω**, II 2).
- ἔστι:** Third person, singular, present, active of **εἶμί** (S. 768). Main verb of the simple coordinate clause (S. 2162). The enclitic throws back its accent onto the previous properispomenon **ξυμφέροντά** (S. 183.c).
- ἑαυτοῖς:** Plural, masculine, dative reflexive pronoun; the antecedent is the unexpressed accusative subject of **τίθεσθαι** (the antecedent for the accusative subject would be **οἱ ἄρχοντες**) (S. 329, 1226). Dative indirect object of the infinitive **τίθεσθαι** (S. 1469, 1967.b).
- τὸ ... ἀξύμφορα:** Second coordinate clause; when the main verb in both coordinate clauses is the same it is not normally repeated (S. 948, 2162).
- τὸ ... μὴ ὀρθῶς:** Nominative subject of the supplied verb **ἔστι** (S. 927, 938). **τὸ:** Singular, neuter, nominative article introducing the adverb (S. 1153.g). **μὴ:** Negative adverb; with adverbs used substantively, the negative **οὐ** is used when a person or thing is meant, but **μὴ** when a person or thing is to be characterized (S. 2734-35). **ὀρθῶς:** Adverb; the adverb is made into a substantive by the addition of an article (S. 1153.g).
- δὲ:** Postpositive conjunction connecting the two coordinate clauses; here the particle **δέ** has an adversative sense and serves to mark that something is different from what precedes, but only to offset it, not to exclude or contradict it (S. 2834-35). “As a connective, **δέ** denotes either pure connection ‘and,’ or contrast, ‘but,’ with all that lies between” (D. **δέ**, pg. 162).

(τὸ τὰ) ἀξύμφορα (ἔστι τίθεσθαι ἑαυτοῖς) = (τὸ τὰ ἀξύμφορά ἐστι τίθεσθαι ἑαυτοῖς): Accusative direct object of the supplied infinitive τίθεσθαι (S. 1554, 1967). The noun lacks an article (S. 1126). Carry down τὸ τὰ ... ἐστι τίθεσθαι ἑαυτοῖς from the previous clause to fill in the brachylogy (S. 3017).

ἦ: Disjunctive conjunction connecting this sentence with the previous one (S. 2856).

πῶς: Interrogative adverb of manner introducing a direct question (S. 346, 1094).

λέγεις: Second person, singular, present, active, indicative of λέγω (S. 383). Main verb of the simple direct question (S. 903). The subject σύ is not expressed but implied in the verb; the nominative of the personal pronoun is usually omitted except when emphatic (S. 929, 1190).

οὕτως: The lone adverb implying a “yes” answer is an ellipsis of ἔστιν οὕτως (S. 2680.c).

Ἄ δ' ἂν θῶνται, ποιητέον τοῖς ἀρχομένοις, καὶ τοῦτό ἐστι τὸ δίκαιον;
Πῶς γὰρ οὔ; (339.c-d)

ἂν: *would.*

ἀρχόμενος, ἀρχομένου, ὁ:

he or the one who is ruled, the ruled.

γὰρ: *for.*

δέ: *but.*

δίκαιον, -ου, τό: *justice, the right or lawful.*

εἶμί: *to be.*

καί: *and.*

ὅς, ἧ, ὅ: *whoever, whichever, whatever.*

οὔ: *not.*

οὗτος, αὕτη, τοῦτο: *this man, woman, or thing.*

ποιητέος, -α, -ον: *to be made or done.*

πῶς: *how?*

τίθεμαι: *to lay down, give, make.*

Ἄ ... ἀρχομένοις: First coordinate clause (S. 2162).

Ἄ δ' ἂν θῶνται: Relative clause in apposition to τοῦτο, the supplied subject of the supplied verb ἔστι (S. 988, 2488-2573). When the antecedent is indefinite, the compound relatives (ὅστις, etc.) are used, but the simple relatives are often employed (as here) instead. When the antecedent is indefinite, ὅς usually has the subjunctive with ἂν (as here) or the optative (S. 2508, 2545.c).

Ἄ: Plural, neuter, accusative relative pronoun used substantively meaning “whatever things”; the antecedent is indefinite (S. 338, 2509). Accusative direct object of θῶνται (S. 1554).

δ' : Postpositive conjunction connecting this sentence with the previous one; here the particle δέ has an adversative sense and serves to mark that something is different from what precedes,

but only to offset it, not to exclude or contradict it (S. 2834-35). “As a connective, **δέ** denotes either pure connection ‘and,’ or contrast, ‘but,’ with all that lies between” (D. **δέ**, pg. 162). An elision of **δέ** (S. 70).

ἄν θῶνται: Main verb of the relative clause (S. 2173). **ἄν**: Relative clauses requiring the subjunctive must have **ἄν**, which is more closely attached to the relative word than it is to the subjunctive (S. 1768). **θῶνται**: Third person, plural, aorist, middle, subjunctive of **τίθημι** (S. 416). The subject **ἐκεῖνοι** (the antecedent is **οἱ ἄρχοντες**) is not expressed but implied in the verb (S. 931). The subjunctive with **ἄν** in a relative clause expresses a possible or supposed fact in future time or a generality in present time (S. 2545.c). The aorist tense of the subjunctive denotes simple occurrence (S. 1860).

ποιητέον {(**τοῦτο ἐστί**) = (**τοῦτ’ ἔστι**)}: Impersonal, active verb (S. 2152). Singular, neuter, nominative verbal adjective used impersonally to express necessity (S. 2152). Predicate nominative modifying **τοῦτ’**, the supplied pronoun after the supplied verb **ἔστι** (S. 1040). Main verb of the complex coordinate clause (S. 2162). **τοῦτ’ ἔστι**: Supply **τοῦτ’** (“this”) as the subject of **ἔστι**; supply **ἔστι** as the main verb of the complex coordinate clause (the copulative verb **εἶναι** is often omitted) (S. 944).

τοῖς ἀρχομένοις: Plural, masculine, dative, present, passive attributive participle of **ἄρχω** used substantively with the article (S. 1153.b, 2050). Dative of agent with **ποιητέον** (S. 2149). Participles used substantively admit distinctions of voice and tense; the present tense denotes continual action (S. 1153.b, 1872.a).

καί: The conjunction connects the two coordinate clauses (S. 2868).

τοῦτό ... δίκαιον: Second coordinate clause (S. 2162).

τοῦτό ἐστι: The combination is commonly written **τοῦτ’ ἔστι** (S. 187.b).

τοῦτό: Singular, neuter, nominative demonstrative pronoun used substantively; the antecedent is the idea contained in the previous clause (S. 1212, 1238, 1247). Nominative subject of **ἐστι** (S. 927, 938). The acute accent on the ultima syllable is thrown back from the following enclitic **ἐστι** (S. 183.c).

ἐστι: Third person, singular, present, active of **εἰμί** (S. 768). Main verb of the simple coordinate clause (S. 2162). The enclitic throws its accent back onto the properispomenon **τοῦτό** (S. 183.c).

τὸ δίκαιον: Singular, neuter, nominative of the adjective **δίκαιος** used substantively with the article (S. 1021, 1153.a). Predicate nominative noun after **ἐστι** (S. 910). A predicate noun may have an article when the noun refers to a definite object (an individual or class) that is well known, previously mentioned or hinted at, or identical with the subject (S. 1152).

Πῶς γὰρ οὐ: The phrase answers “yes” in the form of a question (S. 2680.d). **Πῶς**: Interrogative adverb of manner (S. 346, 1094). **γὰρ**: The post-positive particle marks assent in answers (S. 2806). **οὐ**: The simple negative particle **οὐ** is the negative of fact and statement (S. 2688). The proclitic takes an acute accent at the end of a sentence (S. 180.a). An acute, when not immediately followed by another word, does not change to a grave (S. 154).

Οὐ μόνον ἄρα δίκαιόν ἐστι κατὰ τὸν σὸν λόγον τὸ τοῦ κρείττονος
 ξυμφέρον ποιεῖν, ἀλλὰ καὶ τούναντίον τὸ μὴ ξυμφέρον. (339.d)

ἄρα: *then, therefore.*

δίκαιον, -ου, τό: *justice, the right or lawful.*

εἰμί: *to be.*

ἐναντίον -ου, τό: *the opposite, contrary,
 or reverse.*

κατὰ (+ acc.): *according to.*

κρείττον, -ονος, τό: *the stronger
 or more powerful party.*

λόγος, -ου, ὁ: *argument.*

μή: *not.*

ξυμφέρον, -οντος, τό: *use, profit,
 advantage, interest.*

οὐ μόνον ... ἀλλὰ καί: *not only ...
 but also.*

ποιέω: *to make, do.*

σός, -ή, -όν: *your, of you.*

Οὐ ... ποιεῖν: First coordinate clause (S. 2162).

Οὐ μόνον ... ἀλλὰ καί: The collection of particles connects the two coordinate clauses and means “not only ... but also” (S. 2764).

Οὐ: The simple negative particle **οὐ** is the negative of fact and statement (S. 2688, 2690).

μόνον: Singular, neuter, accusative of the adjective **μόνος** used as an adverb (S. 341, 1094, 1606).

ἄρα: The postpositive particle is often used of direct logical conclusions in conducting an argument (S. 2791).

δίκαιόν: Singular, neuter, nominative of the adjective **δίκαιος** used substantively without the article (S. 1021, 1023, 1126). Nominative subject of **ἐστί** (S. 927, 938). The acute accent on the ultima syllable is thrown back from the following enclitic **ἐστί** (S. 183.c).

ἐστί: Third person, singular, present, active of **εἰμί** (S. 768). Main verb of the simple coordinate clause (S. 2162). The enclitic throws back its accent onto the previous proparoxytone **δίκαιόν** (S. 183.c).

κατὰ τὸν σὸν λόγον: Prepositional phrase; **κατὰ** with the accusative here means “according to” (S. 1690.2.c). **τὸν:** The article is very often omitted in phrases containing a preposition but not here (S. 1128). **σὸν:** Singular, masculine, accusative possessive pronoun used as an adjective modifying **λόγον** (S. 330). A word or group of words standing between the article and its noun is an attributive (S. 1154).

τὸ τοῦ κρείττονος ξυμφέρον: Accusative direct object of the infinitive **ποιεῖν** (S. 1554, 1967).

τοῦ κρείττονος: Singular, neuter, genitive of the comparative adjective **κρείττων** used substantively with the article (S. 319, 1153.a). Genitive of possession or belonging (S. 1297). A word or group of words standing between the article and its noun is an attributive (S. 1154). Attic has **-ττ-** for **-σσ-** of Ionic and most other dialects (S. 78).

ποιεῖν: Present, active infinitive of **ποιέω** (S. 385). Predicate nominative modifying **δίκαιόν** after **ἔστι**; in definitions, the infinitive may be used as a predicate nominative (S. 1986). The present tense of the infinitive denotes continual action (S. 1865).

ἀλλὰ: Adversative conjunction connecting the first and second coordinate clauses (S. 2775).

καὶ ... ξυμφέρον: Second coordinate clause; when the main verb in both coordinate clauses is the same it is not normally repeated (S. 948, 2162).

καὶ: Adverbial use of the particle meaning “also” (S. 2881).

τοῦναντίον (δίκαιόν ἐστι ποιεῖν): Singular, neuter, accusative of the adjective **ἐναντίος** used substantively with the article (S. 1153.a). Accusative direct object of the supplied infinitive **ποιεῖν** (S. 1554, 1967). Elision of **τὸ ἐναντίον** (S. 70). **δίκαιόν ἐστι ποιεῖν**: Carry down **δίκαιόν ἐστι ποιεῖν** from the previous clause to fill in the brachylogy (S. 3017).

τὸ (τοῦ κρείττονος) μὴ ξυμφέρον: Noun phrase in apposition to **τοῦναντίον** (988). **μὴ**: Negative adverb; the negative **μή** is used under the influence of the supplied infinitive **ποιεῖν** (S. 2713). **τοῦ κρείττονος**: Carry down **τοῦ κρείττονος** from the previous clause to fill in the brachylogy (S. 3017).

Τί λέγεις σύ; ἔφη. Ἄ σὺ λέγεις, ἔμοιγε δοκῶ σκοπῶμεν δὲ βέλτιον. (339.d)

βέλτιον: *better, closer.*

δέ: *but.*

δοκέω: *to think, suppose.*

ἔγωγε, ἐμοῦγε: *I at least, for my part, for myself.*

λέγω: *to say, mean.*

ὅς, ἧ, ὅ: *who, which, what.*

σκοπέω: *to look at, consider, examine.*

σύ, σοῦ: *you, of you.*

τίς, τί: *who? what? which?*

φημί: *to say, affirm, assert.*

Τί: Singular, neuter, accusative interrogative pronoun used substantively meaning “what?” (S. 1262). Accusative direct object of **λέγεις** (S. 1554). The interrogative pronoun never changes its accent to the grave (S. 334).

λέγεις: Second person, singular, present, active, indicative of **λέγω** (S. 383). Main verb of the simple interrogative sentence (S. 903).

σύ: Singular, nominative personal pronoun of **σύ** (S. 325). Nominative subject of **λέγεις** (S. 927, 938). The personal pronoun is usually omitted unless emphatic (S. 1190). An acute, when not immediately followed by another word, does not change to a grave (S. 154).

ἔφη: Third person, singular, imperfect, indicative of **φημί** (S. 783). The verb introduces the *oratio recta* (S. 2590). The subject **ἐκεῖνος** (the antecedent is **ὁ Θρασύμαχος**) is not expressed but implied in the verb (S. 931).

Ἄ σὺ λέγεις: Relative clause (S. 2488-2573).

Ἄ: Plural, neuter, accusative relative pronoun used substantively; the antecedent is the supplied pronoun **τὰ αὐτά** (S. 338, 2509). Accusative direct object of **λέγεις** (S. 1554).

σὺ: Singular, nominative personal pronoun of **σύ** (S. 325). Nominative subject of **λέγεις** (S. 927, 938). The personal pronoun is usually omitted unless emphatic (S. 1190).

λέγεις: Second person, singular, present, active, indicative of **λέγω** (S. 383). Main verb of the relative clause (S. 2173).

ἔμοιγε δοκῶ: The personal construction with the dative is regular rather than the impersonal form **δοκεῖ μοι** (S. 1983, 1992.c).

ἔμοιγε: Singular, dative form of the personal pronoun **ἐγώ** (S. 325.b). Dative direct complement of **δοκῶ** (S. 1467.a). The suffix **-γε** attached to the pronoun **ἐγώ** makes it emphatic (S. 325.b). The compound of **ἐμοί γε** becomes a proparoxytone (S. 186.a).

δοκῶ (λέγειν τὰ αὐτά): First person, singular, present, active, indicative of **δοκέω** (S. 385). Main verb of the complex sentence (S. 2173). The subject **ἐγώ** is not expressed but implied in the verb; the nominative of the personal pronoun is usually omitted except when emphatic (S. 929, 1190). **λέγειν τὰ αὐτά:** Supply **λέγειν** as a complementary infinitive with **δοκῶ**; supply **τὰ αὐτά** (“the same things”) as the object of **λέγειν** and the antecedent of **Ἄ** (S. 3017).

σκοπῶμεν: First person, plural, present, active subjunctive of **σκοπέω** (S. 385). Main verb of the simple sentence (S. 903). The subject **ἡμεῖς** (here “us” and not “we”) is not expressed but implied in the verb; the nominative of the personal pronoun is usually omitted except when emphatic (S. 929, 1190). Hortatory subjunctive; the hortatory subjunctive is used to express a request or a proposal (S. 1797). The present tense of the subjunctive denotes continual action (S. 1860).

δέ: Postpositive conjunction connecting this sentence with the previous one; here the particle **δέ** has an adversative sense and serves to mark that something is different from what precedes, but only to offset it, not to exclude or contradict it (S. 2834-35). “As a connective, **δέ** denotes either pure connection ‘and’, or contrast, ‘but’, with all that lies between” (D. **δέ**, pg. 162).

βέλτιον: Singular, neuter, accusative irregular comparative of the adjective **ἀγαθός** used as an adverb (S. 319, 1606).

οὐχ ὠμολόγηται τοὺς ἄρχοντας τοῖς ἀρχομένοις προστάπτοντας ποιεῖν ἄττα ἐνίστε διαμαρτάνειν τοῦ ἑαυτοῖς βελτίστου, ἃ δ' ἂν προστάππωσιν οἱ ἄρχοντες, δίκαιον εἶναι τοῖς ἀρχομένοις ποιεῖν; (339.d)

ἄν: *would.*

ἀρχόμενος, -ομένου, ὅ: *he who is ruled, the ruled.*

ἄρχων, -οντος, ὅ: *he or the one who rules, a ruler.*

ἄττα: *see τις.*

βελτίστον, -ου, τό: *the best, what is best.*

δέ: *and.*

διαμαρτάνω: *to fail utterly.*

δίκαιον, -ου, τό: *justice, the right or lawful.*

ἑαυτοῦ, -ῆς, -οῦ: *of himself, herself, itself.*

εἶμί: *to be.*

ἐνίστε: *at times, sometimes.*

ὁμολογέομαι: *to be agreed upon, allowed by common consent.*

ὅς, ἧ, ὅ: *who, which, what.*

οὐ: *not.*

ποιέω: *to make, do.*

προσάπτω: *to command, order.*

τις, τι: *anyone, anything, someone, something.*

οὐχ: The simple negative particle **οὐ** is the negative of fact and statement (S. 2688). The **-χ** is added to **οὐ** before a rough breathing (S. 137). When **οὐ** introduces a direct question, the answer “yes” is expected (S. 2651).

ὠμολόγηται: Third person, singular, perfect, passive indicative of **ὁμολογέω** (S. 390). Main verb of the complex sentence (S. 2173). Quasi-impersonal verb with two infinitive phrases functioning as the subject (S. 1984-85).

τοὺς ... βελτίστου: The infinitive phrase functions as the first subject of the quasi-impersonal verb **ὠμολόγηται** (S. 1984).

τοὺς ἄρχοντας ... προσάπτοντας: Accusative subject of the infinitive **διαμαρτάνειν** (S. 1972).

τοὺς ἄρχοντας: Plural, masculine, accusative, present, active attributive participle of **ἄρχω** used substantively with the article (S. 1153.b, 2050). Participles used substantively admit distinctions of voice and tense; the present tense denotes continual action (S. 1153.b, 1872.a).

προσάπτοντας: Plural, masculine, accusative, present, active circumstantial participle of **προσάπτω** modifying **ἄρχοντας** (S. 2054). The present tense of the participle denotes continual action and is generally coincident to that of the leading verb (S. 1872.a). Attic has **-π-** for **-σσ-** of Ionic and most other dialects (S. 78).

τοῖς ἀρχομένοις: Plural, masculine, dative, present, passive attributive participle of **ἄρχω** used substantively with the article (S. 1153.b, 2050). Dative object of the participle **προσάπτοντας** (S. 1464, 2040). Participles used substantively admit distinctions of voice and tense; the present tense denotes continual action (S. 1153.b, 1872.a).

ποιεῖν: Present, active infinitive of **ποιέω** (S. 385). An object (complimentary) infinitive after **προσάπτοντας** (S. 2000). The present tense of the infinitive denotes continual action (S. 1865).

ἄττα: Plural, neuter, accusative non-enclitic form (for **τινά**) of the indefinite pronoun **τις** used substantively (S. 334.a, 1266). Accusative direct object of the infinitive **ποιεῖν** (S. 1554, 1967).

ἐνίστε: Adverb (S. 341, 1094).